

# HOST-SELECTIVE TOXINS AND AVIRULENCE DETERMINANTS: What's in a Name?\*

---

Thomas J. Wolpert<sup>1</sup>, Larry D. Dunkle<sup>2</sup>, Lynda M. Ciuffetti<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Botany and Plant Pathology, Oregon State University, Corvallis, Oregon 97331; e-mail: wolpertt@bcc.orst.edu and ciuffetil@bcc.orst.edu; <sup>2</sup>Crop Production and Pest Control Research, U.S. Department of Agriculture-Agricultural Research Service, Department of Botany and Plant Pathology, Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana 47907-1155; e-mail: dunkle@btny.purdue.edu

**Key Words** avirulence factors, compatibility, host-specific toxins, incompatibility, programmed cell death

■ **Abstract** Host-selective toxins, a group of structurally complex and chemically diverse metabolites produced by plant pathogenic strains of certain fungal species, function as essential determinants of pathogenicity or virulence. Investigations into the molecular and biochemical responses to these disease determinants reveal responses typically associated with host defense and incompatibility induced by avirulence determinants. The characteristic responses that unify these disparate disease phenotypes are numerous, yet the evidence implicating a causal relationship of these responses, whether induced by host-selective toxins or avirulence factors, in determining the consequences of the host-pathogen interaction is equivocal. This review summarizes some examples of the action of host-selective toxins to illustrate the similarity in responses with those to avirulence determinants.

## INTRODUCTION

In 1905, Biffen (19) demonstrated that resistance to stripe rust in wheat was inherited in a manner consistent with Mendel's law. Shortly thereafter, Barrus (17) demonstrated that not only could different genotypes of beans display distinctly different disease responses to a strain of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum*, but also that different strains of the pathogen could elicit different disease responses on the same genotypes of the host. By 1931, Craigie (50) had demonstrated that different "physiological races" of rust fungi could arise through sexual recombination. Thus, precedence was established that differences in either the host or the pathogen could dictate the outcome of the plant-microbe interaction. These and related studies set

---

\*The U.S. Government has the right to retain a nonexclusive, royalty-free license in and to any copyright covering this paper.

the stage for Flor's historic work during the 1940s in evaluating the genetic contribution of both the host and the pathogen to the outcome of the disease interaction and the development of the gene-for-gene hypothesis (71, 72). During this same period, the first host-selective toxins (HSTs) were identified, including AK toxin in 1933 (218) and victorin in 1947 (167). These HSTs represented the first clear examples of pathogen factors that establish physiological races and whose interaction with the host could dictate specificity in the plant-microbe interaction. Thus, the discovery of HSTs coincided with a growing appreciation of the specificity of host-parasite interactions and provided the first examples of how such specificity might be determined.

HSTs are referred to as "host selective" because they are typically active only toward plants that serve as hosts for the pathogens that produce them. Currently, the production of HSTs has been documented for some 20 pathogens. They are molecules ranging from low-molecular-weight metabolites to proteins. Thus far, all of the HSTs identified are produced by fungi, and most are required for pathogenicity, such that disease does not occur in the absence of toxin production. In most cases, host sensitivity to a given HST is conditioned by a single gene, and disease does not occur in the absence of toxin sensitivity. The requirement for both toxin production by the pathogen and toxin sensitivity by the host for disease to occur provides compelling evidence that these toxins are causal to disease development. Direct molecular confirmation of this causality has been demonstrated for a number of HSTs. Obviously, as toxins, they are damaging to the plants, and it is generally held that this damage facilitates pathogenesis. Thus, HSTs have been referred to as "agents of compatibility" (231) and appear to mediate this compatibility by inducing host cell death.

In contrast to HSTs, avirulence determinants are "agents of incompatibility." These factors are the products of avirulence genes, which have long been recognized to confer incompatibility to the pathogen in the presence of the cognate resistance gene of the host. Disease occurs in the absence of either the avirulence gene or the corresponding resistance gene. Because of the requirement for expression of the avirulence gene by the pathogen and expression of the corresponding resistance gene by the host for disease resistance to occur, it is clear that avirulence determinants are causal to the disease resistance response. Direct molecular confirmation of this causality has been established in a large number of these so-called, gene-for-gene interactions. In most cases, the predominant phenotype of incompatibility is the localized death of the host, commonly referred to as the hypersensitive response (HR). The role of host cell death in resistance is an issue yet to be resolved. Nevertheless, host cell death is a typical manifestation of the resistance response.

The common association of host cell death with both susceptibility, as in diseases mediated by HSTs, and resistance, as in gene-for-gene interactions, raises the question: What is the distinction in these host responses that accounts for such obviously different outcomes of the host-pathogen interactions? This article describes a few pertinent examples of HSTs and the host responses they evoke to illustrate features in common with responses to avirulence factors. Several

excellent reviews on HSTs (156, 182, 231, 235, 260, 261) and avirulence factors (76, 140, 243) are available.

## SYMPTOMS

At the simplest level of macroscopic symptom expression, a comparison of the consequences of introducing a HST or avirulence determinant into an appropriate plant, in the proper location, reveals that both evoke a cultivar-specific and rapid cell death followed by necrosis of the plant or the tissue exposed. HST activity is normally assayed by direct exposure of the plant or plant tissue to the toxin, which can be achieved by infiltration into tissue or incubation of a tissue segment or intact seedlings in a toxin solution. Similar assays can be employed for some of the characterized avirulence determinants. For example, the avirulence determinants *Avr4* (113), *Avr9* (203), and *Ecp2* (136) from *Cladosporium fulvum*, the INF1 protein of *Phytophthora parasitica* (114), the syringolide products resulting from expression of *AvrD* from *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *tomato* (115), and the NIP1 protein from *Rhynchosporium secalis* (97, 160) all elicit a necrotic response that is macroscopically similar to that induced by most HSTs when introduced into the leaves of a genetically appropriate plant. Thus, absent the context of their primary role in disease, and based on the induced phenotypic responses, these avirulence determinants could be perceived as selective phytotoxins. Viewed from this perspective, and considering that HSTs are clearly virulence determinants, it may be informative to note that the NIP1 protein, along with NIP2 and NIP3, was originally characterized as a toxin (240, 241). NIP1 has been demonstrated to stimulate the barley plasmalemma H<sup>+</sup>-ATPase similar to the toxin, fusicoccin (241), and is believed to function as a virulence factor in the absence of its corresponding resistance gene (160, 240, 241). Also, the *Ecp2* protein from *C. fulvum* was originally demonstrated to function as a virulence factor, with mutants of *Ecp2* showing compromised colonization and reduced growth and conidiation (137). A likely role for avirulence determinants in conferring virulence in the absence of the corresponding resistance gene also has been established for a number of bacterial pathogens (76, 139, 178, 243). The majority of these bacterial determinants have been genetically identified. Attempts to evoke a response by infiltration of the direct product of avirulence genes into the appropriate plant often fail (e.g., 115, 215). The reason for the absence of a host response is beginning to be understood with an increased understanding of type III secretion systems and likely reflects a requirement for intracellular localization to initiate a response (21, 47, 77, 100, 144, 208). When these avirulence determinants are introduced into the cytosol of the appropriate plant, the recipient plant develops a necrotic response similar to that induced by most HSTs (e.g., 58, 88, 165, 221).

## HOST RESPONSES

Similarities in the disease symptoms elicited by treatment with HSTs and avirulence factors suggest that the underlying biochemical mechanisms are similar.

But is this comparison superficial? Is there any evidence to indicate that these phenotypic responses share biochemical and molecular characteristics? The preponderance of evidence indicates that avirulence determinants interact directly or indirectly with the product of their cognate resistance genes to initiate signaling events that lead to the induction of the host defense response (12, 54, 157, 214, 257). Induced defense is an active response that confers disease resistance by limiting the growth and development of the pathogen. It is commonly associated with the production of reactive oxygen species (ROS), alterations in the host cell wall, accumulation of phytoalexins, expression of pathogenesis-related (PR) proteins, and localized death of host cells and tissues, typically referred to as the hypersensitive response (HR). However, despite the common association of these responses with defense, the contribution of each toward delimiting the pathogen is not well defined (98). One of the more promising approaches to understanding the complex phenotype of the resistance response is through a genetic dissection of the signaling pathways that lead to its induction. Considerable progress is being made in this regard, particularly in the “model” plant *Arabidopsis thaliana*. Research on this organism has revealed that the defense response can be mediated through a number of genetically distinguishable, but interconnected, pathways that involve the participation of signaling molecules such as salicylate, jasmonate, and ethylene (70, 86, 164). Ultimately, it should be possible to genetically isolate each of the responses associated with resistance and evaluate their contribution to the manifestation of resistance. This effort likely will establish that the contribution of each of these responses to resistance depends upon the specific plant-pathogen interaction.

At this point, the only unequivocal approach to establish that the host is expressing a resistance response is through an evaluation of the disease phenotype resulting from the combination of the host and pathogen. Even this plant inoculation approach is not without ambiguities, given that incompatibility and compatibility are judged in the context of each other and that the proliferation of the pathogen and apparent host damage during incompatibility in one interaction can approach those of compatibility in another. Because of our limited understanding of avirulence-induced resistance, and because the mode of action of most HSTs is yet to be elucidated, it may be precarious to compare their effects on the host. However, if it is accepted that expression of the various responses typically associated with defense can serve as indicators or “markers” of the resistance response, then some potentially revealing comparisons can be made. Some examples of plant responses to HSTs are described in the following sections to illustrate features shared with responses to avirulence factors.

## Victorin

Perhaps similarities in responses induced by HSTs and those induced by avirulence determinants can be most clearly illustrated with Victoria blight of oats because of the genetic association of susceptibility to this disease with resistance to crown rust of oats. Victoria blight of oats is caused by the fungus *Cochliobolus*

(*Helminthosporium victoriae* (166). This fungus is pathogenic strictly as a result of its ability to produce the HST, victorin (167). All isolates that produce victorin are pathogenic, whereas mutants or segregating progeny that do not produce the toxin are nonpathogenic (200). Sensitivity of oats to victorin, and thus susceptibility to the pathogen are conditioned by the dominant allele at the *Vb* locus. All dominant *Vb* genotypes are both sensitive to victorin and susceptible to the pathogen, and all homozygous recessive genotypes (*vb vb*) are toxin-insensitive and resistant. Thus, Victoria blight occurs only when a victorin-producing isolate of *C. victoriae* encounters an oat plant carrying a dominant allele at the *Vb* locus.

Victoria blight was originally described by Meehan & Murphy in 1946 (166) and found only on oat lines containing Victoria-type resistance to crown rust. The Victoria oat variety had been introduced into the USA from Uruguay for use as a source of resistance to crown rust, caused by the fungus *Puccinia coronata* (145). Crown rust resistance conferred by Victoria-type oats is due to the dominant *Pc2* gene, and the crown rust/oat interaction appears to be a classic gene-for-gene type of interaction. Despite extensive attempts to separate crown rust resistance (*Pc2*) from Victoria blight susceptibility (*Vb*), neither conventional genetic (162, 239) nor mutagenic approaches, including the screening of millions of seedlings for naturally occurring mutants, have separated rust resistance from Victoria blight susceptibility (149, 150). Additional evidence that the *Pc2* gene and the *Vb* gene are either tightly linked or identical has come from an analysis of somaclonal variants generated under toxin selection in tissue culture (194). The results indicated that all plants regenerated from tissue culture lines that became victorin-insensitive also lost crown rust resistance. Thus, it appears that these genes are either very tightly linked or the same gene and, consequently, victorin may be interacting with a resistance gene to evoke responses that result in a susceptible interaction. Physiological studies of victorin support this connection, because victorin appears to induce many of the plant responses classically associated with avirulence elicitors, such as callose deposition (233), the respiratory burst (195), lipid peroxidation (176), ethylene evolution (205), extracellular alkalinization (226), phytoalexin synthesis (163), and  $K^+$  efflux (242). Thus, genetic and physiological studies support the perception that victorin functions as an elicitor to induce components of a resistance response similar to those induced by avirulence factors. But why is victorin perceived as a toxin and assumed to induce host necrosis and facilitate pathogenesis by a necrotrophic fungus?

Evidence is accumulating that the HR cell death response often associated with induced resistance in gene-for-gene interactions is a type of programmed cell death (PCD) (53, 94, 102, 112, 133, 193). PCD is a genetically controlled, organized form of cellular suicide that normally functions to eliminate unnecessary or aged cells during morphogenesis (i.e., by cell selection) or cellular maturation. It is a "normal" form of cell death essential to cellular homeostasis in multicellular organisms. Thus, PCD is distinct from necrotic cell death, which typically arises as a result of severe cellular damage. Necrosis does not entail the participation

of the cell in its own destruction, as does PCD, but rather arises from a loss of function. The distinction between PCD and necrosis may be envisioned as the difference between “organized disassembly” and “death from damage.”

Apoptosis, the most characterized form of PCD in animal systems, displays distinct morphological and biochemical characteristics. Morphologically, apoptosis is characterized by cell shrinkage, condensation of the chromatin, nuclear breakdown, membrane blebbing, and eventual fragmentation of the cell into apoptotic bodies. Visible changes in other organelles typically are minor (116, 230, 255). The biochemical markers of apoptosis include DNA fragmentation into nucleosomal fragments (254) (commonly referred to as DNA laddering), activation of a protease cascade involving unusual enzymes called caspases (67, 91, 103, 219) and, in most cases, mitochondrial dysfunction (2, 69, 103).

Victorin induces a form of PCD that shares many of the biochemical and morphological characteristics of apoptosis, including DNA laddering (176, 213, 258), heterochromatin condensation (258), cell shrinkage (99, 207; W. Bushnell, personal communication), and protease activation (176). Preliminary results indicate that protease activation occurs through a cascade involving the participation of caspase-like enzyme activities (W.C. Coffeen & T.J. Wolpert, unpublished). Furthermore, the signaling events leading to the host response to victorin also share characteristics with signaling events in resistance, including changes in calcium homeostasis and the participation of kinases and ethylene (104, 176, 213, 258). The similarity of the victorin-induced PCD response to the resistance-associated HR is directly reinforced by the observation that a similar response is induced in oats by incompatible isolates of *Puccinia coronata* and by treatment with non-specific elicitors of the defense response (213). Those results are consistent with the finding that incompatibility of cowpea to the cowpea rust pathogen *Uromyces vignae* also shares some of the same characteristics (197), which are probably mediated by low-molecular-weight peptide elicitors (65).

Recent results have demonstrated that victorin contributes to mitochondrial dysfunction (52). This finding is noteworthy because, as mentioned above, mitochondrial dysfunction is commonly associated with the induction of PCD and because victorin had previously been shown to bind to members of the mitochondrial enzyme complex, glycine decarboxylase (GDC) (175, 251–253). In animal cells, the alteration in mitochondrial function associated with apoptosis is evidenced by a loss of mitochondrial transmembrane potential that is due to a mitochondrial permeability transition (MPT) possibly facilitated by the opening of the mitochondrial permeability transition pore (TP) (89, 93, 267). The MPT leads to an abrupt increase in permeability of the mitochondrial membranes to solutes with mol wt <1500 Daltons. When oat mitochondria in vitro undergo a MPT, victorin gains access to the mitochondrial matrix and binds to the GDC (52). Evidence is also consistent with the occurrence of a MPT in vivo during victorin-induced PCD (52). This and other observations have led to the speculation that, although binding of victorin to the GDC may contribute to mitochondrial dysfunction and consequently to PCD, the GDC is not the primary site of action for victorin. Rather,

the results suggest that victorin interacts with a site of action that is upstream of binding to the GDC (52). This initial site likely involves the product of the *Vb* gene, which remains unknown.

Thus, a variety of observations indicate that the response of oat to victorin shares many of the characteristics of an avirulence-elicited defense response. Whether victorin elicits these responses through a direct or indirect interaction with the product of a resistance gene remains to be determined. However, progress in this area may be forthcoming because victorin sensitivity has recently been identified in *A. thaliana*. This sensitivity, as in oat, appears to be conferred by a single dominant gene (J.M. Lorang, N. Carkachi-Salli & T.J. Wolpert, unpublished). This finding will facilitate a more direct evaluation of the possibility that victorin actually elicits a defense response. For example, identification of the gene conferring victorin sensitivity may provide insights into the function of the *Vb/Pc2* gene(s) in oats. It should also be possible to determine if mutations in any of the currently implicated defense pathways in *Arabidopsis* impact the effects of victorin.

## AAL-Toxin

The AAL-toxins are a group of structurally related HSTs (22, 23, 30) produced by *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici* (82), with the most prevalent forms designated as AAL-toxin TA and TB. The pathogen causes *Alternaria* stem canker of tomato (95), and resistance to the disease and sensitivity to the toxin are conditioned by the *Asc* locus. Disease resistance is dominant, whereas toxin sensitivity is incompletely dominant. The homozygous recessive genotype is fully sensitive to the toxin, and the heterozygote displays intermediate sensitivity (46). Isolates incapable of producing AAL-toxins do not cause the disease (82), and mutants that are compromised in toxin production concomitantly lose their pathogenic phenotype (6).

The AAL-toxins induce an apoptotic-like response in toxin-sensitive tomato, as demonstrated by TUNEL-positive cells, DNA laddering, and the formation of apoptotic-like bodies (237). This PCD response, as in the HR, appears to involve calcium (237) and ethylene (83, 171) and, therefore, exhibits similarities to an induced resistance response. The AAL-toxins are part of a larger group of compounds structurally related to sphingosine and sphinganine, and are referred to as sphinganine analog mycotoxins, or SAMs. Other SAMs, known as fumonisins, are produced by the unrelated fungus *Fusarium verticillioides* (syn. *F. moniliforme*) and other *Fusarium* species (18). Interestingly, both fumonisin B1, the major fumonisin produced in culture, and AAL-toxin also induce apoptosis in monkey kidney cells (236). Fumonisin B1 (and other fumonisins) is as selectively toxic to the AAL-toxin sensitive tomato genotypes as the AAL-toxins (85, 135). This similarity in responses has led to the hypothesis that AAL-toxin-induced PCD likely involves ceramide signaling and disruption of the cell cycle (80, 81, 84). This speculation is supported by the fact that both fumonisin B1 and TA inhibit ceramide synthase in rat hepatocytes (170) and microsomal preparations from green tomato

fruit (83), with a concomitant alteration in the concentration of sphingoid bases (1). The recent cloning and characterization of the *Asc* locus in tomato also supports this hypothesis (26). The *Asc-1* gene is homologous to the yeast longevity assurance gene, *LAG1*, and has been proposed to compensate for depletion in ceramides by facilitating a sphingolipid-dependent transport mechanism either through the production of alternate ceramides or by encoding a SAM-insensitive sphinganine-*N*-acyltransferase (26). The recessive *asc-1* allele was found to contain a premature stop codon and, thus, likely encodes a nonfunctional truncated form of the protein (26).

Given the similarity in responses elicited by AAL-toxins and fumonisins, recent studies have provided particular relevance to a comparison of the responses evoked by HSTs and avirulence determinants (8, 211). Fumonisin B1 treatment of *A. thaliana* elicited a HR-like response that includes PCD, generation of ROS, deposition of phenolic compounds and callose, accumulation of phytoalexin, and expression of PR proteins (211). Further, this response requires jasmonate-, ethylene-, and salicylate-dependent signaling pathways (8) and, thus, appears remarkably similar to a defense response elicited by an avirulence determinant. Curiously, fumonisin B1-resistant *Arabidopsis* mutants were not noticeably compromised in their avirulence response to *avrRpt2*-expressing isolates of *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *maculicola*, but these mutants did show enhanced resistance to virulent isolates of the pathogen (211).

## T-Toxin

T-toxin, the HST produced by *Cochliobolus heterostrophus* (*Helminthosporium maydis* = *Bipolaris maydis*) race T and *Mycosphaerella zeae-maydis* (*Phyllosticta maydis*), is certainly the best-characterized HST in regard to its site and mode of action (141, 192). Both organisms produce a group of structurally related polyketides that are selectively toxic to maize (55, 124). Toxin-producing isolates are considerably more virulent than nonproducing isolates, and mutations in structural proteins required for toxin production clearly reduce virulence (261). *C. heterostrophus* causes Southern corn leaf blight, a disease of maize carrying Texas cytoplasm for male sterility (*cms-T*), and T-toxin is selectively toxic to *cms-T* maize. Parental lines with Texas male sterile cytoplasm were used extensively in hybrid seed production in the 1950s and 1960s because their use eliminated the need for hand emasculation. Consequently, most of the maize grown in the United States during this period was of this type (141, 192), which led to a major epidemic of the Southern corn leaf blight in 1970.

The association of toxin sensitivity with *cms-T* male sterility, a cytoplasmically inherited factor, led to the investigation of mitochondria as a possible site of action. These studies revealed that T-toxin selectively affected mitochondria isolated from *cms-T* plants compared to those that were isolated from normal cytoplasm (male fertile) maize. These responses include uncoupling of oxidative phosphorylation, stimulation of succinate- or NADH-driven state 4 respiration, inhibition of



malate-driven state-3 respiration, leakage of small molecules such as calcium and  $\text{NAD}^+$ , and mitochondrial swelling (141, 192). Analysis of the mitochondrial genome led to the discovery of a unique gene (*T-urf13*) in *cms-T* mitochondria, which apparently arose through recombination and encodes a protein of approximately 13 kDa (60). The *cms-T* genotype was also associated with a 13-kDa protein (URF13) that was localized to the mitochondrial membrane (62, 73, 74, 244). Definitive proof that URF13 conferred toxin sensitivity was achieved by expression of the *T-urf13* in *Escherichia coli*, which rendered these cells sensitive to T-toxin (61). The URF13 polypeptide associates predominantly as a tetramer in the mitochondrial membrane and, upon direct binding of T-toxin, undergoes a conformational change that leads to the formation of a pore in the mitochondrial membrane (141, 192). Pore formation leads to the observed effects on mitochondrial function through the leakage of cofactors, substrates and protons.

The pore-forming role of T-toxin is particularly compelling in the context of PCD. The mitochondrion, as discussed above, has been implicated as a key regulator of PCD in animals and recently has been proposed to play a similar role in PCD in plants (111, 133). In animals, the apoptotic response is often associated with permeabilization of the mitochondrial membrane through induction of pore formation. A number of pro-apoptotic proteins, such as Bax, have been proposed to lead to pore formation either indirectly through interaction with an endogenous pore-forming mechanism (the TP, discussed above) or directly by forming a pore in mitochondrial membranes (2, 51, 103, 159). Further, expression of Bax in tobacco leads to a response with phenotypic similarities to the HR, including the induced expression of PR proteins (132). Given that T-toxin induces a pore through interaction with URF13, it is possible that T-toxin produces responses similar to the expression of Bax. This speculation gains credibility with the recent association of cytoplasmic male sterility and PCD (14). It will be important to evaluate the cell death phenotype induced by T-toxin in the context of PCD and other responses associated with the resistance response. Does T-toxin induce DNA laddering, an oxidative burst, and the accumulation of PR proteins? Studies of this nature could provide a unique opportunity to investigate mechanistic links between the regulation of PCD in plants and animals and evaluate the association of PCD with resistance and susceptibility.

## HC-Toxin

*Cochliobolus carbonum* (*Helminthosporium carbonum* = *Bipolaris zeicola*) causes Northern leaf spot and ear rot of maize. Of the three races of the pathogen that have been reported, only race 1 produces HC-toxin, a cyclic tetrapeptide with host-selective activity against susceptible genotypes of maize (96, 143, 189, 201, 234). The non-toxin-producing races (race 2 and race 3) are common and prevalent throughout the world but cause smaller lesions and less damage on a diverse range of maize genotypes than the combination of race 1 on toxin-sensitive maize (201, 228, 229). Thus, HC-toxin is considered a virulence factor, because race 1

exhibits increased lesion size on sensitive maize, but the toxin is not required for pathogenicity of the species.

Resistance to *C. carbonum* race 1 and insensitivity to HC-toxin are determined by the dominant allele at the *Hm1* locus (177, 227). The *Hm1* gene encodes a carbonyl reductase, HC-toxin reductase (HCTR) (107), which inactivates the toxin by enzymatically reducing the ketone function (168, 169) on the side chain of the 2-amino-8-oxo-9,10-epoxyoctadecanoic acid (aoe) residue, which in addition to the epoxide moiety of aoe (42, 232) is essential for toxic activity (117). Genotypes homozygous for transposon-disrupted *Hm1* (107, 168) or naturally occurring mutants with disrupted *Hm1* (172) (commonly designated *hm1 hm1*) lack the HCTR activity and are fully susceptible to *C. carbonum* race 1.

Some effects of HC-toxin on host plant tissues could be construed as beneficial. Many of these effects are directly opposed to those induced by other HSTs. Instead of inducing a general leakage of electrolytes, HC-toxin increases uptake of organic and inorganic solutes by susceptible maize roots (264) and stimulates uptake, accumulation, and reduction of nitrate (263). In contrast to the effects of most HSTs on cell membranes, HC-toxin induces membrane hyperpolarization of susceptible maize cells rather than depolarization (79). Further, instead of killing protoplasts, HC-toxin increases the long-term viability of leaf protoplasts a few days beyond that of protoplasts incubated in the absence of HC-toxin (245). Most of the effects of HC-toxin also are observed with tissues of the resistant genotype but only at toxin concentrations 100- to 200-fold higher than those that affect the susceptible genotype.

Also in contrast to the HSTs described above, there is no evidence to suggest that HC-toxin elicits defense responses (ROS, PCD, phytoalexin accumulation, alterations in membrane permeability, etc.) in the toxin-sensitive host. Available evidence, in fact, indicates that HC-toxin prevents the operation of resistance mechanisms and functions as a suppressor of defense responses (34, 66). Inoculation of leaves of the susceptible genotype with conidia of the non-toxin-producing race 2 in combination with HC-toxin or following prior treatment with toxin, results in the expression of full susceptibility to the otherwise weakly virulent pathogen (32, 49), suggesting that host responses that restrict the ability of race 2 to infect are compromised by HC-toxin. More significantly, in converse experiments, prior inoculation of toxin-sensitive maize leaves with conidia of race 2, a non-toxin-producing race, induces localized resistance that is effective against race 1, the toxin producer. Prior inoculation with race 2 reduces the expression of disease symptoms elicited by race 1 to those indistinguishable from symptoms elicited by race 2 (32, 33). However, application of HC-toxin abolishes the induced resistance, again suggesting a role of HC-toxin in preventing the host from mounting an effective defense.

Among the genotype-specific responses elicited by HC-toxin is an alteration in protein synthesis, resulting in the expression of a few new proteins and the suppressed synthesis of others when compared to proteins synthesized by the resistant genotype and by both genotypes treated with inactivated toxin (41). These

proteins have not been identified, and no cause-and-effect relationship with the disease phenotype has been documented. However, HC-toxin has no effect on amino acid incorporation (41, 264) or on in vitro translation of maize mRNA (41), indicating that the toxin does not inhibit processes directly involved in protein synthesis. Thus, it is tenable to propose that HC-toxin influences gene expression, which impacts the expression of defense (13, 231). HC-toxin, as well as structurally related cyclic tetrapeptides, inhibits histone deacetylase (HDAC) from a variety of organisms (27). Treatment of maize embryos and tissues cultures with HC-toxin and infection of susceptible but not resistant leaves results in the accumulation of hyperacetylated forms of core histones (191). However, Baidyaroy et al. (10) discount the role of HC-toxin as a suppressor of defense responses and argue that, because HDACs can function as corepressors, the maize defense genes may be overexpressed during infection. Thus, although HDACs likely are primary sites of HC-toxin action (191), the issue of the consequences of effects on gene expression remains unresolved.

Examination of the mode of action of HC-toxin clearly indicates that it does not induce responses similar to the host defense response. Consequently, it shows no similarity to avirulence elicitors in this regard. However, the results do show that, ironically, HC-toxin has little toxicity yet clearly functions as a virulence factor. Also, it appears likely that it affects gene expression and can interfere with expression of the defense response. These activities of HC-toxin are remarkably similar to a proposed role of avirulence determinants in virulence. Some avirulence proteins may function like the virulence factors of *Yersinia* sp. (and related bacteria) to interfere with the signaling and structural pathways of host defense (208, 243). Thus, HC-toxin may share functional similarities with avirulence factors. Perhaps establishing the mode of action of HC-toxin will contribute to an understanding of the role of avirulence factors in conferring virulence in the absence of their corresponding resistance gene.

## Other HSTs

The precise mode of action of most of the HSTs remains unknown. However, available evidence from a number of examples suggests that HST activity requires an active host response. The active participation of the host in its own cell death is inconsistent with a necrotic response and is suggestive of a form of PCD. Toxins other than the ones discussed above appear to involve such active host responses. For example, the toxic effects of peritoxin (PC-toxin), the HST produced by the soilborne pathogen of sorghum, *Periconia circinata* (154), are inhibited by cycloheximide and cordycepin, inhibitors of protein and RNA synthesis, respectively (247). PC-toxin treatment of toxin-sensitive sorghum also induces the increased synthesis of a number of proteins (247), a response reminiscent of the induction of PR proteins in the defense response. Interestingly, one of the earliest ultrastructural changes induced in the host by PC-toxin is highly condensed heterochromatin (7), one of the hallmarks of apoptosis. Also, cycloheximide has been demonstrated

to inhibit the toxic effects of AK-toxin, the HST produced by the pathotype of *Alternaria alternata* that causes black spot disease of Japanese pear (122). This toxin also induces the active synthesis of callose (182, 185), a response indicative of the resistance response. Some effects of Ptr ToxA, one of the protein HSTs produced by *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*, causal agent of tan spot of wheat, are also influenced by temperature and inhibitors of RNA and protein synthesis, with the latter preventing the onset of necrosis (43, 130, 131).

## CELL DEATH, COMPATIBILITY, AND INCOMPATIBILITY

A necrotroph is a pathogen that kills host tissue as it colonizes and obtains nutrients from the killed cells (210). Most toxin-producing pathogens, including those that produce HSTs, are considered necrotrophs. At least some HSTs elicit a response that requires the participation of the host in regulating cell death. This observation not only begs the question of whether these compounds should be called toxins, but also indicates that the pathogen per se does not kill the host but that the host “kills itself.” Further, the association of markers typical of the resistance response with those of cell death suggests that, in some cases, the pathogen may be taking advantage of resistance responses to facilitate pathogenesis. This mechanism of involving the participation of the host in its own cell death may not be unique to the HST-producing fungi discussed above. For example, it has been demonstrated that the expression of a number of antiapoptotic genes, including the human *Bcl-2* and *Bcl-xl* genes, the nematode (*Caenorhabditis elegans*) *CED-9* gene, and the baculovirus *Op-IAP* gene, can impact pathogenesis by a number of necrotrophs (64). Transgenic plants expressing these genes were resistant to the necrotrophs *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*, *Botrytis cinerea*, and the toxin-producing necrotroph, *Cercospora nicotianae*. This resistance appeared to be dependent on the prevention of PCD. Inoculation of wild-type plants with *S. sclerotiorum* resulted in a susceptible response and was associated with the formation of DNA ladders, typical of a PCD response. PCD was prevented in transgenic plants expressing *Bcl-2*-mediated resistance. Also, transgenic plants expressing a mutant of *Bcl-xl*, which compromises its antiapoptotic function in animals, also failed to confer resistance to *S. sclerotiorum*. This suggests that successful colonization of the host by those pathogens is dependent on active host participation at least through regulation of PCD.

The dependence of *S. sclerotiorum*, *B. cinerea*, and *C. nicotianae* on host PCD for pathogenesis is particularly significant given that the generation of ROS has been implicated as essential for pathogenesis in each of those pathogens. Thus, events commonly associated with resistance, an HR-like PCD response and ROS formation, are involved in susceptibility. ROS generation and concomitant redox signaling have been proposed to play a central role in the integration of the diverse array of plant defense responses (53, 92, 98, 257), and the production of ROS, irrespective of the source or even the chemical nature of the ROS, may be sufficient

to elicit the defense response (198). Accordingly, the generation of ROS suggests that the defense response is activated. Cercosporin, the toxin produced by many *Cercospora* species, when activated by light in the presence of oxygen, elicits the production of singlet oxygen and superoxide (56, 57). Also, *S. sclerotiorum* (90) and *B. cinerea* (59, 90, 220) induce ROS production by the host. The extent of ROS generation induced by *B. cinerea* is positively correlated with the ability of a given isolate to cause disease (59, 220), and enhanced ROS production in the host is correlated with increased virulence of *B. cinerea* and *S. sclerotiorum*. Conversely, inhibition of ROS formation with diphenyleioidonium, a putative inhibitor of the NADPH-dependent oxidase system, compromises susceptibility (90). Susceptibility also was compromised in the HR-deficient *dnd1* mutant of *Arabidopsis*, and the resistance response elicited by an avirulent race of *Pseudomonas syringae* enhanced susceptibility to *B. cinerea* (90). These results support the contention that these organisms exploit the host resistance response for susceptibility. The association of susceptibility with the induction of ROS also is indicated by the interaction of *Drechslera* species with oats (87) and *Bipolaris sorokiniana* with barley (129).

A biotroph is a pathogen that obtains organic nutrition from living cells of the host (210), and a hemibiotroph exhibits both necrotrophic and biotrophic phases during disease development (108). Microorganisms that produce avirulence determinants can display necrotrophic, biotrophic, and hemibiotrophic lifestyles. Host cell death in the form of the HR commonly associated with the resistance response has been suggested (98, 101, 102), with some supportive data (202), to be an important component of the defense response for obligate biotrophs. However, a general role for host cell death in resistance (as with other resistance-associated responses), particularly in necrotrophs and hemibiotrophs, is not obvious (193). In some cases, cell death does not appear to contribute substantially to the resistance response (265).

HST-producing fungi are considered to be necrotrophs, and a role of host cell death in susceptibility is generally accepted. However, even in these examples, a role for cell death in susceptibility is not always apparent. HC-toxin clearly facilitates pathogenesis but, as summarized above, is thought to be cytostatic rather than toxic (231). Thus, host cell death does not seem to be a consistent requirement for pathogenesis. Careful examination of growth of *C. victoriae* in susceptible and resistant oats also suggests that cell death may not be necessary for pathogenesis (262). In these experiments, conidia of *C. victoriae* attached, germinated, formed appressoria, and penetrated the leaf surface. Both toxin-producing and nonproducing isolates developed to the same extent up to about 8–12 h after inoculation. After this time, toxin-producing (pathogenic) isolates produced intercellular and intracellular hyphae, which continued to ramify through the tissue of susceptible oats. By 24 h, the mesophyll contained numerous hyphae, and by 48 h, leaf tissue was overrun by the fungus. However, the first visible effects on the host cells were noted at about 48 h. Separation of host cell death and pathogenesis has also been indicated in the interactions of AK-toxin-producing isolates of *A. alternata* that are

pathogenic on Japanese pear and AM-toxin-producing isolates that are pathogenic on apple (122). Pretreatment of the toxin-sensitive pear with agents that prevent AK-toxin-induced necrosis did not affect disease development. Also, it was found that light suppressed AM-toxin-induced host necrosis but had no effect on the rate of fungal infection of toxin-sensitive apple leaves by toxin-producing isolates.

It would also appear that, in at least some cases, host cell death is not sufficient for pathogenesis by HST-producing organisms. For example, some *Fusarium* species produce SAMs that produce the same effects as AAL-toxins (above) and yet are not pathogenic on tomatoes. A recent study by Brandwagt et al. (25) identified a number of *Nicotiana* species that are sensitive to AAL-toxins, yet the majority of those species were resistant to infection by *A. alternata* f.sp. *lycopersici*. *Cochliobolus* species are noted for their production of HSTs, and these fungi commonly infect grasses. However, preliminary results indicate that transformation of *C. carbonum* with the *ToxA* gene, which confers pathogenicity to nonpathogenic isolates of *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis* (45), the causal agent of tan spot of wheat, does not enable the Ptr *ToxA*-producing transformants to be pathogenic on wheat (L.M. Ciuffetti, unpublished). The recent discovery of victorin-sensitive *Arabidopsis* genotypes should provide an opportunity to determine whether sensitivity to victorin is sufficient to promote pathogenesis by toxin-producing isolates of *C. victoriae*.

Thus, just as the role of host cell death in resistance in gene-for-gene interactions is ambiguous, the same may be true for its role in susceptibility to many HST-producing fungi. While host cell death may contribute to resistance in some gene-for-gene interactions, it may be neither necessary nor sufficient for resistance in others. In diseases caused by some HST-producing fungi, host cell death is likely to play a role in susceptibility. However, the role of host cell death in susceptibility to all HST-producing fungi is not clear, nor is it clear that all HST-producing fungi are strictly necrotrophs, deriving nutrients only from killed cells with cell death sufficient for pathogenesis.

## STRUCTURE AND BIOSYNTHESIS

Some of the HSTs that have been chemically characterized are listed in Table 1. Most HSTs are low-molecular-weight, diverse secondary metabolites that exist as families of structurally similar compounds. As a group, HSTs affect a range of monocotyledonous and dicotyledonous plants (Table 1). The following examples of some selected HSTs illustrate the diversity of structures and mechanisms of biosynthesis.

### *Alternaria alternata*

The various pathotypes of *Alternaria alternata* are determined by the toxins they produce and, consequently, the hosts that are sensitive to their HSTs. The HSTs produced by a particular pathotype of *A. alternata* are usually multiple forms of related

**TABLE 1** Examples of host-selective toxins

Pathogen	Host/Pathotype	Toxin	Chemical class <sup>a</sup>	Sus/Sen <sup>b</sup>
<i>Alternaria alternata</i>	Japanese pear	AK-toxin	Epoxy-decatrienoic esters	Dominant
	Strawberry	AF-toxin	Epoxy-decatrienoic esters	Dominant
	Tangerine	ACT-toxin	Epoxy-decatrienoic esters	Dominant
	Apple	AM-toxin	Cyclic tetrapeptide	Dominant
	Tomato	AAL-toxin	Aminopentol esters	Recessive <sup>c</sup>
	Rough lemon	ACR(L)-toxin	Terpenoid	Dominant
<i>Bipolaris sacchari</i>	Sugarcane	HS-toxin	Glycosylated sesquiterpene	—
<i>Cochliobolus carbonum</i>	Corn	HC-toxin	Cyclic tetrapeptide	Recessive
<i>Cochliobolus heterostrophus</i>	Corn	T-toxin	Linear polyketols	Cytoplasmically inherited
<i>Cochliobolus victoriae</i>	Oats	Victorin	Cyclized chlorinated peptide	Dominant
<i>Mycosphaerella zae-maydis</i>	Corn	PM-toxin	Linear polyketols	Cytoplasmically inherited
<i>Periconia circinata</i>	Sorghum	Peritoxin	Peptidyl chlorinated polyketide	Incompletely dominant
	Wheat	Ptr ToxA	13.2-kDa protein	Dominant
<i>Pyrenophora tritici-repentis</i>	Wheat	Ptr ToxB	6.6-kDa protein	Dominant

<sup>a</sup>Chemical class descriptions for the HSTs produced by *Alternaria alternata* were taken from Brandwagt (24).

<sup>b</sup>Susceptibility to the fungus and sensitivity to the toxin.

<sup>c</sup>Susceptibility to the fungus is recessive and sensitivity to the toxin is semidominant.

compounds (123, 179, 182, 231). The HST-producing species of *Alternaria* are intriguing examples of intraspecific variation and of the evolution of pathogenicity governed by specific phytotoxic metabolites (216). For example, AK-toxins are produced by the Japanese pear pathotype (causal agent of black spot of Japanese pear), ACT-toxins are produced by the tangerine pathotype (causal agent of brown spot of tangerine), and AF-toxins are produced by the strawberry pathotype (causal agent of *Alternaria* black spot of strawberry) (174). All of those HSTs have a common moiety, 9,10-epoxy-8-hydroxy-9-methyl-decatrienoic acid, that serves as a precursor to the toxins (68, 174, 216). REMI (restriction enzyme-mediated integration) was used to mutagenize and tag the *AKT1* and *AKT* genes, which are required for AK-toxin biosynthesis and pathogenicity of the Japanese pear pathotype (216). Homologues of *AKT1* and *AKT2* are present also in isolates of the tangerine and strawberry pathotypes (161, 216). In further studies, the complex genomic region that controls AK-toxin biosynthesis was shown to contain two additional genes,

*AKT3* and *AKTR*, also necessary for AK-toxin production. *AKT1*, *AKT2*, *AKT3*, and *AKTR* and their homologues are present on a single chromosome (217).

AM-toxin, produced by the apple pathotype of *A. alternata* (causal agent of *Alternaria* blotch) is a four-membered cyclic depsipeptide (180, 225). Recently, a 13.1-kb cyclic peptide synthetase gene, *AMT*, was cloned and found to be absent from non-toxin-producing isolates of *A. alternata* (110). Disruption of *AMT* or spontaneous loss of the 1.1-Mb conditionally dispensable chromosome resulted in mutants that are unable to produce AM-toxin and are no longer pathogenic (109).

AAL-toxins, produced by the tomato pathotype of *A. alternata* (causal agent of *Alternaria* stem canker of tomato), as mentioned above, are structurally related to fumonisins and, thus, are members of the sphinganine analog mycotoxins (SAMs) (18, 30, 82, 83, 236). Not surprisingly, *A. alternata* f.sp. *lycopersici* also produces fumonisin B<sub>1</sub> (36). AAL-toxins consist of an aminopentol backbone that is esterified to a tricarboxylic acid group, and each analogue has two isomers (22–24). AAL-toxin-deficient REMI mutants are nonpathogenic on tomato and characterization of these mutants is in progress (6).

### *Bipolaris sacchari*

HS-toxins (HS-toxin A, B, and C) produced by *Bipolaris* (*Helminthosporium*) *sacchari*, the causal agent of eyespot disease of sugarcane, are composed of four galactose units linked to a sesquiterpene aglycone (C<sub>15</sub>H<sub>24</sub>O<sub>22</sub>), which can occur in three isomeric forms in toxins designated A<sub>2,2</sub>, B<sub>2,2</sub>, or C<sub>2,2</sub> (147, 151–153, 261). The aglycone C was isolated from the mycelium of the fungus and proposed to be a biosynthetic precursor based on incorporation of exogenously supplied <sup>3</sup>H-aglycone into active HS-toxin by *B. sacchari* cultures (173). The appearance of inactive HS-toxin analogs with 1, 2, or 3 galactose units linked to the sesquiterpene in culture filtrates of *B. sacchari* (147) was found to be associated with degradation of the active toxin resulting from an increase in activity of β-galactofuranosidase (146).

### *Cochliobolus* Species

HC-toxin is a family of cyclic tetrapeptides, with *cyclo*-(D-proline-L-alanine-D-alanine-L-2-amino-8-oxo-9,10-epoxydecanoic acid) as the predominant form (96, 189, 234) produced by race 1 isolates of *Cochliobolus carbonum*. HC-toxin production is controlled by a single Mendelian locus, *Tox2*, a complex locus composed of multiple copies of multiple genes. HC-toxin is produced by a 570-kDa non-ribosomal peptide synthetase, called HC-toxin synthetase (HTS), encoded by *HST1* (184, 204). Two functional copies of *HST1* are found only in race 1 isolates of *C. carbonum*. In addition to *HST1*, other genes of *Tox2* have been identified and characterized. *TOXA* encodes an HC-toxin efflux pump (188); *TOXC* encodes a beta subunit of fatty acid synthase (4); *TOXF* encodes a putative branched-chain amino acid aminotransferase (37); *TOXG* encodes an alanine racemase that functions in the synthesis of D-Ala (38); and *TOXE* likely encodes a regulatory protein,



but is not required for the expression of *HST1* (5). The multiple genes in *Tox2*, with the exception of one copy of *TOXE*, are physically linked within an approximately 600-kb region (2a, 38). *Tox2* is present on different chromosomes in different groups of race 1 isolates (3, 31).

T-toxin (HMT-toxin or BMT-toxin) is a mixture of linear polyketols ( $C_{35}$  to  $C_{41}$ ) produced by race T isolates of *Cochliobolus heterostrophus*, causal agent of Southern corn leaf blight (124, 128, 186). The major difference between race T isolates and the less virulent race O isolates of *C. heterostrophus* is the *Tox1* locus (138) and the production of T-toxin. *Tox1* is associated with the breakpoints of a reciprocal translocation (35, 224). Based on genetic and physical analyses, *Tox1* is comprised of two unlinked loci, *Tox1A* and *Tox1B*, which are on different chromosomes (118). Tagged mutations at *Tox1* led to the cloning of *PKS1*, which encodes a polyketide synthase (148, 256), and *DECI*, which has similarity to decarboxylases (196). Targeted inactivation of either of these genes results in the loss of T-toxin production and, thus, virulence on T-cytoplasm corn (118, 196, 256).

*Mycosphaerella zae-maydis* (*Phyllosticta maydis*), causal agent of yellow leaf blight of corn, produces a HST, PM-toxin (48, 259). PM-toxin is a family of long-chain linear polyketols ( $C_{33}$  and  $C_{35}$ ) that are structurally similar to T-toxin (55, 125). As with T-toxin, PM-toxin is selectively active against T-cytoplasm corn and specifically binds to the T-urf13 protein (62, 75). Because of the similarities in structure, specificity, and site and mode of action of PM-toxin and T-toxin, the biosynthesis of these toxins may be similar in *M. zae-maydis* and *C. heterostrophus*.

Victorin, the HST produced by *Cochliobolus victoriae*, is composed of a group of closely related cyclized pentapeptides. The predominant form of the toxin in culture, designated victorin C, is composed of glyoxylic acid and a cyclic combination of five unusual amino acids: 5,5-dichloroleucine, threo- $\beta$ -hydroxylysine, erythro- $\beta$ -hydroxyleucine,  $\alpha$ -amino- $\beta$ -chloro-acrylic acid, and 2-alanyl-3,5-dihydroxycyclopentenone (victalanine) (155, 250). A number of other naturally occurring structural variants of victorin have been characterized and given the trivial names of victorin B, D, E, and victoricine (249). Those forms of victorin differ from victorin C in the extent of the chlorination of the N-terminal leucine residue (victorins B and E), in the absence of a hydroxyl group on the victalanine residue (victorin D), or a complete lack of chlorination at the leucine residue and the replacement of victalanine with 2,5 DOPA (victoricine). Another form of victorin, designated HV-toxin M, was identified and characterized by Kono et al. (127). This form of the toxin is identical to victorin C except that it contains a glycine residue instead of the glyoxylic acid. Only minor differences in activities of the various forms of victorin are observed (248) with the exception of HV-toxin M, which appears to exhibit substantially lower activity than the other forms (127).

The molecular genetics of victorin biosynthesis is being investigated. A REMI mutant of *C. victoriae* has been identified that lacks victorin production and is no longer pathogenic (261; A.C.L. Churchill, W. Lu, O.C. Yoder, B.G. Turgeon &

V. Macko, unpublished). It is anticipated that a peptide synthetase is involved in victorin biosynthesis.

### *Periconia circinata*

*Periconia circinata*, causal agent of sorghum root rot, produces a group of low-molecular-weight HSTs called peritoxins (PC-toxin) (39, 154, 190, 246). Peritoxins A and B are selectively toxic and consist of a cyclized peptide and a chlorinated polyketide (39, 154). Inactive intermediates have been identified and characterized and these, along with peritoxins A and B, are absent from nonpathogenic, non-toxin-producing strains of *P. circinata*. Based on those studies, it was proposed that a peptide synthetase and a polyketide synthase are involved in the biosynthesis of peritoxins (39).

### *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*

In contrast to other HST toxins, the HSTs thus far characterized from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis* (causal agent of tan spot of wheat) are ribosomally synthesized proteins. Ptr ToxA (syn. Ptr necrosis toxin, Ptr toxin, ToxA) is a 13.2-kDa protein and Ptr ToxB (syn. Ptr chlorosis toxin) is a 6.6-kDa protein (15, 40, 212, 222, 223, 266). Other host-selective activities, in addition to Ptr ToxA and Ptr ToxB, have been identified, but these putative HSTs have not been characterized (28, 43, 63, 223). Recently, Effertz et al. (67a) partially purified a third host-selective toxin produced by *P. tritici-repentis* and designated this toxin, Ptr ToxC (syn. Ptr chlorosis toxin). Based on the characterization thus far, Ptr ToxC appears to be a polar, nonionic, low-molecular-weight molecule (67a). Based on the ability of an isolate to induce necrosis and/or chlorosis on a set of wheat differentials, a race designation system was proposed by Lamari et al. (134) that distinguishes 5 races. The development of these symptoms was found to be dependent upon a specific combination of the host genotype and the isolate of *P. tritici-repentis* tested. It is likely that, in this disease interaction, race specificity is dictated primarily by the production of a combination of multiple HSTs.

Two groups independently cloned a cDNA for the major necrosis-inducing toxin, Ptr ToxA (16, 44, 45). Sequence analysis of the cDNA clone indicated that *ToxA* (syn. *PtrNEC*) encodes a 19.7-kDa preproprotein. The precursor is composed of a signal peptide necessary for secretion, a small domain at the N terminus comprising an anionic peptide that is not present in the mature toxin, and a larger domain at the C terminus comprising the mature, cationic toxin. A genomic clone of the *ToxA* gene was isolated along with its endogenous promoter, and expression was shown to be sufficient for pathogenicity. When transformed into a non-toxin-producing, nonpathogenic isolate of the fungus, the *ToxA* gene conferred upon this isolate toxin-producing ability and pathogenicity (45). In isolates analyzed thus far, the *ToxA* gene appears to be a single-copy gene that is absent from non-toxin-producing isolates of *P. tritici-repentis* (16, 44, 45). Recently, the *ToxB* gene was cloned and characterized from a race 5 isolate of *P. tritici-repentis* (158). In

contrast to Ptr ToxA, Ptr ToxB is a single-domain protein. The *ToxB* gene contains a 261-bp open reading frame that encodes a 23-amino acid signal peptide and a 64-amino acid HST. In contrast to *ToxA*, at least five copies of the *ToxB* gene are present in race 5 isolates tested (158). Interestingly, nonpathogenic isolates of *P. tritici-repentis* contain a single-copy gene (*toxb*) with 86 % identity to *ToxB* at the nucleotide level (J.P. Martinez & L.M. Ciuffetti, unpublished).

In addition to the protein toxins of *P. tritici-repentis*, Otani et al. (183) reported the isolation of a 35-kDa HST (AB-toxin) from *Alternaria brassicicola*, causal agent of black leaf spot. This proteinaceous HST awaits further characterization and stands in contrast to other HSTs produced by *Alternaria* species.

## Other HSTs

Additional HSTs or potential HSTs have been documented in the literature. Examples include: maculosin from *A. alternata* on spotted knapweed (20, 209), ACRL-toxin from *A. alternata* on rough lemon (78, 121, 182), AT-toxin from *A. alternata* on tobacco (119, 120), ACTG-toxin from *A. alternata* on tangerine (126), AS-I toxin from *A. alternata* on sunflower (142), SV-toxins from *Stemphylium vesicarium* on European pear (206), and destruxin B from *A. brassicae* on brassicas (9, 11, 29, 187, 238).

## Avirulence Gene Products

A comparison of the structures of most HSTs with avirulence gene products would suggest few similarities. However, clear exceptions to this are the protein HSTs produced by *P. tritici-repentis*, the causal agent of tan spot of wheat. In this interaction, the differential production of toxins dictates a complex race structure. Further, two of the toxins have been characterized and shown to be proteins, direct gene products, and single dominant genes in the host confer sensitivity to each of these toxins. These features bear similarities to most of the avirulence determinants characterized from fungi, particularly those from the tomato pathogen *Cladosporium fulvum*. Because of the genetic pattern of toxin production and host sensitivity, tan spot of wheat appears to be a true gene-for-gene interaction except that virulence and compatibility, rather than avirulence and incompatibility, are the dominant features.

Most of the remaining HSTs that have been characterized appear to be the products of multifunctional enzymes or enzymatic pathways and exist as families of compounds. Consequently, they are considered secondary metabolites. This appears in marked contrast to the majority of avirulence determinants, which appear to be proteins. However, obvious exceptions to this are the syringolide avirulence elicitors. The syringolides are a group of glycolipid secondary metabolites produced as a consequence of the expression of allelic variants of *avrD* and are comprised of three closely related structures. Syringolides 1 and 2 are produced by class I alleles of *avrD*, and syringolides 1 and 3 are produced by class II

alleles (106). Hence, syringolides are exceptional because they are secondary metabolites that serve as avirulence elicitors. However, it is important to realize that most of the avirulence determinants have been characterized only genetically. The role of these determinants in virulence and/or avirulence is not understood, and they typically show little homology to other proteins in existing databases (208). Consequently, in most cases, it has not been established that the protein product of the given avirulence gene directly serves as the elicitor. Clues that this may not always be the case come from *AvrBs2*, which appears to encode an enzyme with similarities to agrocinopine synthase and glycerol phosphodiesterase (243), the YopJ family of avirulence determinants, which may be cysteine proteases (208), and *Avr-Pita*, which encodes a zinc metalloprotease (105). Thus, while most HSTs appear to be secondary metabolites and most avirulence determinants may be proteins, reciprocal examples of both exist. Consequently, an examination of structures serves little to differentiate their functions in determining the outcome of a disease interaction.

## CONCLUDING REMARKS

In this article, we have compared host responses to HSTs, “agents of compatibility,” and avirulence determinants, “agents of incompatibility.” These comparisons are admittedly tenuous given the general lack of understanding about the function and mode-of-action of these determinants. However, in some cases, it would appear that significant characteristics are shared by each and that evidence can be found that some HSTs elicit an active host response that is remarkably similar to the resistance response elicited by avirulence determinants. Also, in some cases, HSTs may function to confer virulence in a manner similar to the proposed role in virulence for some avirulence determinants in the absence of their cognate resistance gene. This suggests that a deeper understanding of each of these determinants could be mutually beneficial and contribute substantially to our understanding of the development of the disease process.

The suggestion that HSTs, in some cases, may be evoking defense responses may not be surprising given that many defense responses are often elicited in the later stages of compatible interactions and differences in the intensity and timing of such responses may be the factors that determine the outcome of the disease interaction. In the absence of thorough comparative studies, or definitive evaluation of the mode-of-action of the HSTs implicated, this possibility cannot be discounted. However, if it is accepted that some HSTs function by directly eliciting the defense response, a number of interesting theoretical and practical questions arise. Do any of the responses commonly associated with defense actually confer resistance or are some of these HST-producing fungi “immune” to the defense response? If some of these fungi are unaffected by the defense response, did this require coevolution with the host? Alternatively, could sensitivity toward host defense be an evolved response?

Also, if resistance-associated host cell death is sufficient for pathogenesis by necrotrophs that produce HSTs, why is it not sufficient for necrotrophs that produce avirulence determinants? Finally, if some organisms can exploit the defense response for pathogenesis, then is it possible that engineering plants to initiate this response when confronted by any invading microorganism could, in some cases, result in disease development?

A comparison of plant responses to HSTs and avirulence determinants indicates that there are no host responses that are clearly definitive markers of disease resistance or susceptibility and that the role of the pathogen is as important as the host defense response in determining the outcome of the disease interaction. Defining how HSTs contribute to compatibility will further our understanding of plant host/pathogen interactions.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Research on HSTs in T.J. Wolpert's laboratory was funded in part by grants from the National Science Foundation (IBN-9631442) and the U.S. Department of Agriculture NRICGP (1999-02404). Research on HSTs in L.M. Ciuffetti's laboratory was funded in part by grants from the U.S. Department of Agriculture NRICGP (2001-35319-10017) and the National Science Foundation (IBN-9600914).

**The Annual Review of Phytopathology is online at <http://phyto.annualreviews.org>**

## LITERATURE CITED

1. Abbas HK, Tanaka T, Duke SO, Porter JK, Wray EM, et al. 1994. Fumonisin- and AAL-toxin-induced disruption of sphingolipid metabolism with accumulation of free sphingoid bases. *Plant Physiol.* 106:1085–93
2. Adrain C, Martin SJ. 2001. The mitochondrial apoptosome: a killer unleashed by the cytochrome seas. *Trends Biochem. Sci.* 26:390–97
- 2a. Ahn J-H, Cheng Y-Q, Walton JD. 2002. An extended physical map of the *TOX2* locus of *Cochliobolus carbonum* required for biosynthesis of HC-toxin. *Fungal Genet. Biol.* 35:31–38
3. Ahn J-H, Walton JD. 1996. Chromosomal organization of *TOX2*, a complex locus controlling host-selective toxin biosynthesis in *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Plant Cell* 8:887–97
4. Ahn J-H, Walton JD. 1997. A fatty acid synthase gene in *Cochliobolus carbonum* required for production of the plant pathogenicity factor HC-toxin, cyclo (D-prolyl-L-alanyl-D-alanyl-L-2-amino-9,10-epoxy-8-oxodecanoyl). *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 10:207–14
5. Ahn J-H, Walton JD. 1998. Regulation of cyclic peptide biosynthesis and pathogenicity in *Cochliobolus carbonum* by TOXEp, a novel protein with a bZIP basic DNA-binding motif and four ankyrin repeats. *Mol. Gen. Genet.* 260:462–69
6. Akamatsu H, Itoh Y, Kodama M, Otani H, Kohmoto K. 1997. AAL-toxin-deficient mutants of *Alternaria alternata* tomato pathotype by restriction enzyme-mediated integration. *Phytopathology* 87:967–72
7. Arias JA, Dunkle LD, Bracker CE. 1983. Ultrastructural and developmental

- alterations induced by *Periconia circinata* toxin in the root tip of sorghum. *Can. J. Bot.* 16:1491–505
8. Asai T, Stone JM, Heard JE, Kovtun Y, Yorgey P, et al. 2000. Fumonisin B1-induced cell death in Arabidopsis protoplasts requires jasmonate-, ethylene-, and salicylate-dependent signaling pathways. *Plant Cell* 12:1823–35
  9. Ayer WA, Pena-Rodriguez LM. 1987. Metabolites produced by *Alternaria brassicae*, the black spot pathogen of canola. 1. The phytotoxic components. *J. Nat. Prod.* 50:400–7
  10. Baidyaroy D, Brosch G, Ahn JA, Grassle S, Wegener S, et al. 2001. A gene related to yeast *HOS2* histone deacetylase affects extracellular depolymerase expression and virulence in a plant pathogenic fungus. *Plant Cell* 13:1609–24
  11. Bains PS, Tewari JP. 1987. Purification, chemical characterization and host specificity of the toxin produced by *Alternaria brassicae*. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 30:259–71
  12. Baker B, Zambryski P, Staskawicz B, Dinesh-Kumar SP. 1997. Signaling in plant-microbe interactions. *Science* 276:726–33
  13. Baldwin D, Crane V, Yalpani N, Briggs S. 1998. HC-toxin: Does inter-species chromatin remodeling confer host-pathogen compatibility? See Ref. 123a, pp. 101–4
  14. Balk J, Leaver CJ. 2001. The PET1-CMS mitochondrial mutation in sunflower is associated with premature programmed cell death and cytochrome c release. *Plant Cell* 13:1803–18
  15. Ballance GM, Lamari L, Bernier CC. 1989. Purification and characterization of a host-selective necrosis toxin from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 35:203–13
  16. Ballance GM, Lamari L, Kowatsch R, Bernier CC. 1996. Cloning, expression and occurrence of the gene encoding the Ptr necrosis toxin from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* On-Line Publ. no. 1996/1209ballance
  17. Barrus MF. 1911. Variation of varieties of beans in their susceptibility to anthracnose. *Phytopathology* 1:190–95
  18. Bezuidenhout SC, Gelderblom WCA, Gorst-Allmann RMM, Marasas WFO, Spiteller G, et al. 1988. Structure elucidation of the fumonisins, mycotoxins from *Fusarium moniliforme*. *J. Chem. Soc. Chem. Commun.* 11:743–45
  19. Biffen RH. 1905. Mendel's law of inheritance and wheat breeding. *J. Agric. Sci.* 1:4–48
  20. Bobylev M, Bobyleva LI, Strobel GA. 1996. Synthesis and bioactivity of analogs of maculosin, a host-specific phytotoxin produced by *Alternaria alternata* on spotted knapweed (*Centaurea maculosa*). *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 44:3960–64
  21. Bonas U, Van den Ackerveken G. 1997. Recognition of bacterial avirulence proteins occurs inside the plant cell: a general phenomenon in resistance to bacterial diseases? *Plant J.* 12:1–7
  22. Bottini AT, Bowen JR, Gilchrist DG. 1981. Phytotoxins II. Characterization of a phytotoxic fraction from *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *Tetrahedron Lett.* 22:2723–26
  23. Bottini AT, Gilchrist DG. 1981. Phytotoxins I. A 1-aminodimethylheptadecapentol from *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *Tetrahedron Lett.* 22:2719–22
  24. Brandwagt B. 2001. *Resistance of Plants to the Fungal Pathogen Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*—Discovery of a Novel Type of Plant Disease Resistance Gene. Wageningen: Ponsen Looijen. 112 pp.
  25. Brandwagt BF, Kneppers TJA, Van der Weerden GM, Nijkamp HJJ, Hille J. 2001. Most AAL toxin-sensitive *Nicotiana* species are resistant to the tomato fungal pathogen *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 14:460–70

26. Brandwagt BF, Mesbah LA, Takken FLW, Laurent PL, Kneppers TJA, et al. 2000. A longevity assurance gene homolog of tomato mediates resistance to *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici* toxins and fumonisin B1. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 97:4961–66
27. Brosch G, Ransom R, Lechner T, Walton JD, Loidl P. 1995. Inhibition of maize histone deacetylase by HC toxin, the host-selective toxin of *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Plant Cell* 7:1941–50
28. Brown DA, Hunger RM. 1993. Production of a chlorosis-inducing, host-specific, low-molecular weight toxin by isolates of *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*, cause of tan spot of wheat. *J. Phytopathol.* 137: 221–32
29. Buchwaldt L, Jensen JS. 1991. HPLC purification of destruxins produced by *Alternaria brassicae* in culture on leaves of *Brassica napus*. *Phytochemistry* 30: 2311–16
30. Caldas ED, Jones AD, Ward B, Winter CK, Gilchrist DG. 1994. Structural characterization of three new AAL toxins produced by *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 42: 327–33
31. Canada SR, Dunkle LD. 1997. Polymorphic chromosomes bearing the *Tox2* locus in *Cochliobolus carbonum* behave as homologs during meiosis. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 63:996–1001
32. Cantone FA, Dunkle LD. 1990. Resistance in susceptible maize to *Helminthosporium carbonum* race 1 induced by prior inoculation with race 2. *Phytopathology* 80:1221–24
33. Cantone FA, Dunkle LD. 1990. Involvement of an inhibitory compound in induced resistance in maize to *Helminthosporium carbonum*. *Phytopathology* 80: 1225–30
34. Cantone FA, Dunkle LD. 1991. Reversible effects of inhibitory diffusates from maize inoculated with *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 39: 111–22
35. Chang H-R, Bronson CR. 1996. A reciprocal translocation and possible insertions(s) tightly associated with host-specific virulence in *Cochliobolus heterostrophus*. *Genome* 39:549–57
36. Chen JP, Mirocha CJ, Xie WP, Hogge L, Olson D. 1992. Production of the mycotoxin fumonisin B1 by *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 58:3928–31
37. Cheng Y-Q, Ahn J-H, Walton JD. 1999. A putative branched-chain-amino-acid transaminase gene required for HC-toxin biosynthesis and pathogenicity in *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Microbiology* 145:3539–46
38. Cheng Y-Q, Walton JD. 2000. A eukaryotic alanine racemase gene involved in cyclic peptide biosynthesis. *J. Biol. Chem.* 275:4906–11
39. Churchill ACL, Dunkle LD, Silbert W, Kennedy KJ, Macko V. 2001. Differential synthesis of peritoxins and precursors by pathogenic strains of the fungus *Periconia circinata*. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 67:5721–28
40. Ciuffetti LM, Franc L, Ballance GM, Bockard WW, Lamari L, et al. 1998. Standardization of toxin nomenclature in the *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*/wheat interaction. *Can. J. Plant Pathol.* 20:422–25
41. Ciuffetti LM, Kim SD, Knoche HW, Dunkle LD. 1995. Maize DNA alkylation and genotype-specific alterations in protein synthesis induced by the host-selective toxin produced by *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 46:61–70
42. Ciuffetti LM, Pope MR, Dunkle LD, Daly JM, Knoche HW. 1983. Isolation and structure of an inactive product derived from the host-specific toxin produced by *Helminthosporium carbonum*. *Biochemistry* 22:3507–10
43. Ciuffetti LM, Tuori RP. 1999. Advances

- in the characterization of the *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*-wheat interaction. *Phytopathology* 89:444–49
44. Ciuffetti LM, Tuori RP, Gaventa JM. 1996. Analysis of the *ToxA* gene of *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*, causal agent of tan spot of wheat. *Phytopathology* 86:S91 (Abstr.)
  45. Ciuffetti LM, Tuori RP, Gaventa JM. 1997. A single gene encodes a selective toxin causal to the development of tan spot of wheat. *Plant Cell* 9:135–44
  46. Clouse SD, Gilchrist DG. 1987. Interaction of the *asc* locus in F<sub>8</sub> paired lines of tomato with *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici* and AAL-toxin. *Phytopathology* 77:80–82
  47. Collmer A. 1998. Determinants of pathogenicity and avirulence in plant pathogenic bacteria. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 1: 329–35
  48. Comstock JC, Martinson CA, Gengenbach BG. 1973. Host specificity of a toxin from *Phyllosticta maydis* for Texas cytoplasmically male sterile maize. *Phytopathology* 63:1357–60
  49. Comstock JC, Scheffer RP. 1973. Role of host-selective toxin in colonization of corn leaves by *Helminthosporium carbonum*. *Phytopathology* 63:24–29
  50. Craigie JH. 1931. An experimental investigation of sex in the rust fungi. *Phytopathology* 21:1001–40
  51. Crompton M. 2000. Bax, Bid and the permeabilization of the mitochondrial outer membrane in apoptosis. *Curr. Opin. Cell Biol.* 12:414–19
  52. Curtis MJ, Wolpert TJ. 2002. The oat mitochondrial permeability transition and its implication in victorin binding and induced cell death. *Plant J.* 29:295–312
  53. Dangl JL, Dietrich RA, Richberg MH. 1996. Death don't have no mercy: cell death programs in plant-microbe interactions. *Plant Cell* 8:1793–807
  54. Dangl JL, Jones JDG. 2001. Plant pathogens and integrated defense responses to infection. *Nature* 411:826–32
  55. Danko SJ, Kono Y, Daly JM, Suzuki Y, Takeuchi S, et al. 1984. Structure and biological activity of a host-specific toxin produced by the fungal corn pathogen *Phyllosticta maydis*. *Biochemistry* 23: 759–66
  56. Daub ME, Ehrenschaft MM. 2000. The photoactivated *Cercospora* toxin cercosporin: contributions to plant disease and fundamental biology. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 38:461–90
  57. Daub ME, Hangarter RP. 1983. Light-induced production of singlet oxygen and superoxide by the fungal toxin, cercosporin. *Plant Physiol.* 73:855–57
  58. de Feyter R, McFadden H, Dennis L. 1998. Five avirulence genes from *Xanthomonas campestris* pv. *malvacearum* cause genotype-specific cell death when expressed transiently in cotton. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 11:698–701
  59. Deighton N, Muckenschnabel I, Goodman BA, Williamson B. 1999. Lipid peroxidation and the oxidative burst associated with infection of *Capsicum annuum* by *Botrytis cinerea*. *Plant J.* 20:485–92
  60. Dewey RE, Levings CS III, Timothy DH. 1986. Novel recombinations in the maize mitochondrial genome produce a unique transcriptional unit in the Texas male-sterile cytoplasm. *Cell* 44:439–49
  61. Dewey RE, Siedow JN, Timothy DH, Levings CS III. 1988. A 13-kilodalton maize mitochondrial protein in *E. coli* confers sensitivity to *Bipolaris maydis* toxin. *Science* 239:293–95
  62. Dewey RE, Timothy DH, Levings CS III. 1987. A mitochondrial protein associated with cytoplasmic male sterility in the T cytoplasm of maize. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 84:5374–78
  63. DeWolf ED, Effertz RJ, Ali S, Francel LJ. 1998. Vistas of tan spot research. *Can. J. Plant Pathol.* 20:349–444
  64. Dickman MB, Park YK, Oltersdorf T, Li W, Clemente T, et al. 2001. Abrogation of disease development in plants expressing



- animal antiapoptotic genes. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 98:6957–62
65. D'Silva I, Heath MC. 1997. Purification and characterization of two novel hypersensitive response-inducing specific elicitors produced by the cowpea rust fungus. *J. Biol. Chem.* 272:3924–27
66. Dunkle LD, Cantone FA, Ciuffetti LM. 1991. Accumulation of host-specific toxin produced by *Cochliobolus carbonum* during pathogenesis of maize. *Phyiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 38:265–73
67. Earnshaw WC, Martins LM, Kaufmann SH. 1999. Mammalian caspases: structure, activation, substrates, and functions during apoptosis. *Annu. Rev. Biochem.* 68:383–424
- 67a. Effertz RJ, Meinhardt SW, Anderson JA, Jordahl JG, Francl LJ. 2002. Identification of a chlorosis-inducing toxin from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis* and the chromosomal location of an insensitivity locus in wheat. *Phytopathology* 92:527–33
68. Feng BN, Nakatsuka S, Goto T, Tsuge T, Nishimura S. 1990. Biosynthesis of host-selective toxins produced by *Alternaria alternata* pathogens. I. (8R,9S)-9,10-epoxy-8-hydroxy-9-methyl-deca-(2E,4Z,6E)-trienoic acid as a biological precursor of AK-toxins. *Agric. Biol. Chem.* 54:845–48
69. Ferri KF, Kroemer G. 2001. Mitochondria—the suicide organelles. *BioEssays* 23:111–15
70. Feys BJ, Parker JE. 2000. Interplay of signaling pathways in plant disease resistance. *Trends Genet.* 16:449–55
71. Flor HH. 1946. Genetics of pathogenicity in *Melampsora lini*. *J. Agric. Res.* 73: 335–57
72. Flor HH. 1947. Inheritance of reaction to rust in flax. *J. Agric. Res.* 74:241–62
73. Forde BG, Leaver CJ. 1980. Nuclear and cytoplasmic genes controlling synthesis of variant mitochondrial polypeptides in male-sterile maize. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 77:418–22
74. Forde BG, Oliver RJC, Leaver CJ. 1978. Variation in mitochondrial translation products associated with male-sterile cytoplasts in maize. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 75:3841–45
75. Frantzen KA, Daly JM, Knoche HW. 1987. The binding of host-selective toxin analogs to mitochondria from normal and 'Texas' male sterile cytoplasm maize. *Plant Physiol.* 83:863–69
76. Gabriel DW. 1999. Why do pathogens carry avirulence genes? *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 55:205–14
77. Galan JE, Collmer A. 1999. Type III secretion machines: bacterial devices for protein delivery into host cells. *Science* 284:1322–28
78. Gardner JM, Kono Y, Tatum JH, Suzuki Y, Takeuchi S. 1985. Plant pathotoxins from *Alternaria citri*: the major toxin specific for rough lemon plants. *Phytochemistry* 24:2861–68
79. Gardner JM, Scheffer RP, Higinbotham N. 1974. Effects of host-specific toxins on electropotentials of plant cells. *Plant Physiol.* 54:246–49
80. Gilchrist DG. 1997. Mycotoxins reveal connections between plants and animals in apoptosis and ceramide signaling. *Cell Death Differen.* 4:689–98
81. Gilchrist DG. 1998. Programmed cell death in plant disease: the purpose and promise of cellular suicide. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 36:393–414
82. Gilchrist DG, Grogan RG. 1976. Production and nature of a host-specific toxin from *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *Phytopathology* 66:165–71
83. Gilchrist DG, Wang H, Bostock RM. 1995. Sphingosine-related mycotoxins in plant and animal diseases. *Can. J. Bot.* 73:S459–67
84. Gilchrist D, Wang H, Lincoln J, Overduin B, Bostock R. 1998. Lethal logic in apoptosis: toxins trigger programmed cell death during disease in eukaryotic cells. See Ref. 123a, pp. 141–50
85. Gilchrist DG, Ward B, Moussato V,

- Mirocha CJ. 1992. Genetic and physiological response to fumonisin and AAL-toxin by intact tissues of higher plants. *Mycopathologia* 117:57–64
86. Glazebrook J. 2001. Genes controlling expression of defense responses in *Arabidopsis*—2001 status. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 4:301–8
87. Gonner MV, Schlosser E. 1993. Oxidative stress in interactions between *Avena sativa* L. and *Drechslera* spp. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 42:221–34
88. Gopalan S, Bauer DW, Alfano JR, Loniello AO, He SY, et al. 1996. Expression of the *Pseudomonas syringae* avirulence protein AvrB in plant cells alleviates its dependence on the hypersensitive response and pathogenicity (Hrp) secretion system in eliciting genotype-specific hypersensitive cell death. *Plant Cell* 8: 1095–5
89. Gottlieb RA. 2001. Mitochondria and apoptosis. *Biol. Signals Recept.* 10:147–61
90. Govrin EM, Levine A. 2000. The hypersensitive response facilitates plant infection by the necrotrophic pathogen *Botrytis cinerea*. *Curr. Biol.* 10:751–57
91. Goyal L. 2001. Cell death inhibition: keeping caspases in check. *Cell* 104: 805–8
92. Grant JJ, Loake GJ. 2000. Role of reactive oxygen intermediates and cognate redox signaling in disease resistance. *Plant Physiol.* 124:21–29
93. Green DR, Reed JC. 1998. Mitochondria and apoptosis. *Science* 281:1309–12
94. Greenberg JT, Sussex I. 1996. Programmed cell death: a way of life for plants. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 93:12094–97
95. Grogan RG, Kimble KA, Misaghi I. 1975. A stem canker disease of tomato caused by *Alternaria alternata* f. sp. *lycopersici*. *Phytopathology* 65:880–86
96. Gross ML, McCrery D, Crow F, Tomer KB, Pope MR, et al. 1982. The structure of the toxin from *Helminthosporium carbo-num*. *Tetrahedron Lett.* 23:5381–84
97. Hahn M, Jungling S, Knogge W. 1993. Cultivar-specific elicitation of barley defense reactions by the phytotoxic peptide NIP1 from *Rhynchosporium secalis*. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 6:745–54
98. Hammond-Kosack KE, Jones JDG. 1996. Resistance gene-dependent plant defense response. *Plant Cell* 8:1773–91
99. Hanchey P, Wheeler H, Luke HH. 1968. Pathological changes in ultrastructure effects of victorin on oat roots. *Am. J. Bot* 55:53–61
100. He SY. 1998. Type III protein secretion systems in plant and animal pathogenic bacteria. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 36:363–92
101. Heath MC. 1998. Apoptosis, programmed cell death and the hypersensitive response. *Eur. J. Plant Pathol.* 104:117–24
102. Heath MC. 2000. Hypersensitive response-related death. *Plant Mol. Biol.* 44: 321–34
103. Hengartner MO. 2000. The biochemistry of apoptosis. *Nature* 407:770–76
104. Ishihara A, Miyagawa H, Kuwahara Y, Ueno T, Mayama S. 1996. Involvement of Ca<sup>2+</sup> ion in phytoalexin induction in oats. *Plant Sci.* 115:9–16
105. Jia Y, McAdams SA, Bryan GT, Hershey HP, Valent B. 2000. Direct interaction of resistance gene and avirulence gene products confers rice blast resistance. *EMBO J.* 19:4004–14
106. Ji C, Okinaka Y, Takeuchi Y, Tsurushima T, Buzzell RI, et al. 1997. Specific binding of syringolide elicitors to a soluble protein fraction from soybean leaves. *Plant Cell* 9:1425–33
107. Johal GS, Briggs SP. 1992. Reductase activity encoded by the *Hm1* disease resistance gene in maize. *Science* 258:985–87
108. Johal GS, Gray J, Gruis D, Briggs SP. 1995. Convergent insights into mechanisms determining disease and resistance response in plant-fungal interactions. *Can. J. Bot.* 73:S468–74
109. Johnson LJ, Johnson RD, Akamatsu H,

- Salamiah A, Otani H, et al. 2001. Spontaneous loss of a conditionally dispensable chromosome from the *Alternaria alternata* apple pathotype leads to loss of toxin production and pathogenicity. *Curr. Genet.* 40:65–72
110. Johnson RD, Johnson L, Itoh Y, Kodama M, Otani H, et al. 2000. Cloning and characterization of a cyclic peptide synthetase gene from *Alternaria alternata* apple pathotype whose product is involved in AM-toxin synthesis and pathogenicity. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 13:742–53
111. Jones AM. 2000. Does the plant mitochondrion integrate cellular stress and regulate programmed cell death? *Trends Plant Sci.* 5:225–30
112. Jones AM. 2001. Programmed cell death in development and defense. *Plant Physiol.* 125:94–97
113. Joosten MHAJ, Cozijnsen TJ, De Wit PJGM. 1994. Host resistance to a fungal tomato pathogen lost by a single base-pair change in an avirulence gene. *Nature* 367:384–86
114. Kamoun S, van West P, Vleeshouwers VGAA, deGroot KE, Govers F. 1998. Resistance of *Nicotiana benthamiana* to *Phytophthora infestans* is mediated by the recognition of the elicitor protein INF1. *Plant Cell* 10:1413–24
115. Keen NT, Tamaki S, Kobayashi D, Gerhold D, Stayton M, et al. 1990. Bacteria expressing avirulence gene D product produce a specific elicitor of the soybean hypersensitive reaction. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 3:112–21
116. Kerr JFR, Wyllie AM, Currie AR. 1972. Apoptosis: a basic biological phenomenon with wide-ranging implications in tissue kinetics. *Br. J. Cancer* 24:239–57
117. Kim S-D, Knoche HW, Dunkle LD. 1987. Essentiality of the ketone function for toxicity of the host-specific toxin produced by *Helminthosporium carbonum*. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 30:433–40
118. Kodama M, Rose MS, Yang G, Yun SH, Yoder OC, et al. 1999. The translocation-associated *Tox1* locus of *Cochliobolus heterostrophus* is two genetic elements on two different chromosomes. *Genetics* 151:585–96
119. Kodama M, Suzuki T, Otani H, Kohmoto K, Nishimura S. 1990. Purification and bioassay of host-selective AT-toxin from *Alternaria alternata* causing brown spot of tobacco. *Ann. Phytopathol. Soc. Jpn.* 56:628–36
120. Kohmoto K, Hosotani K, Otani H, Nishimura S. 1981. Partial purification of host-specific toxin (AT) produced by tobacco pathotype of *Alternaria alternata*. *Ann. Phytopathol. Soc. Jpn.* 47:384
121. Kohmoto K, Kohguchi T, Kondoh Y, Otani H, Nishimura S, et al. 1985. The mitochondria: the prime site for a host-selective toxin (ACR-toxin I) produced by *Alternaria alternata* pathogenic to rough lemon. *Proc. Jpn. Acad.* 61B:269–72
122. Kohmoto K, Otani H, Kodama M, Nishimura S. 1989. Host recognition: Can accessibility to fungal invasion be induced by host-specific toxins without necessitating necrotic cell death? In *NATO ASI Ser., Vol. H27. Phytotoxins and Plant Pathogenesis*, ed. A Graniti, RD Durbin, A Ballio, pp. 249–65
123. Kohmoto K, Otani H, Tsuge T. 1995. *Alternaria alternata* pathogens. In *Pathogenesis and Host Specificity in Plant Disease: Histopathological Biochemical, Genetic and Molecular Bases*, Vol. 2. *Eukaryotes*, ed. K Kohmoto, US Singh, RP Singh, pp. 51–63. Oxford: Pergamon
- 123a. Kohmoto K, Yoder OC, eds. 1998. *Molecular Genetics of Host-Specific Toxins in Plant Disease*. Dordrecht, Netherlands: Kluwer
124. Kono Y, Daly JM. 1979. Characterization of the host-specific pathotoxin produced by *Helminthosporium maydis*, race T, affecting corn with Texas male sterile cytoplasm. *Bioorg. Chem.* 8:391–97

125. Kono Y, Danko SJ, Suzuki Y, Takeuchi S, Daly JM. 1983. Structure of the host-specific pathotoxins produced by *Phylosticta maydis*. *Tetrahedron Lett.* 24:3803–6
126. Kono Y, Gardner JM, Takeuchi S. 1986. Structure of the host-selective toxins produced by a pathotype of *Alternaria citri* causing brown spot disease of mandarins. *Agric. Biol. Chem.* 50:801–4
127. Kono Y, Kinoshita T, Takeuchi S, Daly JM. 1986. Structure of HV-toxin M, a host-specific toxin-related compound produced by *Helminthosporium victoriae*. *Agric. Biol. Chem.* 50:2689–91
128. Kono Y, Knoche HW, Daly JM. 1981. Structure: fungal host-specific. In *Toxins in Plant Disease*, ed. RD Durbin, pp. 221–57. New York: Academic
129. Kumar J, Huckelhoven R, Beckhove U, Nagarajan S, Kogel KH. 2001. A compromised Mlo pathway affects the response of barley to the necrotrophic fungus *Bipolaris sorokiniana* (teleomorph: *Cochliobolus sativus*) and its toxins. *Phytopathology* 91:127–33
130. Kwon CY, Rasmussen JB, Franc L, Meinhart SW. 1996. A quantitative bioassay for necrosis toxin from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis* based on electrolyte leakage. *Phytopathology* 86:1360–63
131. Kwon CY, Rasmussen JB, Meinhart SW. 1998. Activity of Ptr ToxA from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis* requires host metabolism. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 52:201–12
132. Lacomme C, Santa Cruz S. 1999. Bax-induced cell death in tobacco is similar to the hypersensitive response. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 96:7956–61
133. Lam E, Kato N, Lawton M. 2001. Programmed cell death, mitochondria and the plant hypersensitive response. *Nature* 411:848–53
134. Lamari L, Sayoud R, Boulif M, Bernier CC. 1995. Identification of a new race of *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*: implications for the current pathotype classification system. *Can. J. Plant Pathol.* 17:312–18
135. Lamprecht SC, Marasas WFO, Alberts JF, Cawood ME, Gelderblom WCA, et al. 1994. Phytotoxicity of fumonisins and TA-toxin to corn and tomato. *Phytopathology* 84:383–91
136. Laugé R, Joosten MHAJ, Haanstra JPW, Goodwin PH, Lindhout P, et al. 1998. Successful search for a resistance gene in tomato targeted against a virulence factor of a fungal pathogen. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 95:9014–18
137. Laugé R, Joosten MHAJ, Van den Ackerveken GFJM, Van den Broek HWJ, De Wit PJGM. 1997. The in planta-produced extracellular proteins ECP1 and ECP2 of *Cladosporium fulvum* are virulence factors. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 10:725–34
138. Leach J, Tegtmeier KJ, Daly JM, Yoder OC. 1982. Dominance at the *Tox1* locus controlling T-toxin production by *Cochliobolus heterostrophus*. *Physiol. Plant Pathol.* 21:327–33
139. Leach JE, Vera Cruz VM, Bai J, Leung H. 2001. Pathogen fitness as a predictor of durability of disease resistance genes. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 39:187–224
140. Leach JE, White FF. 1996. Bacterial avirulence genes. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 34:153–79
141. Levings CS, Rhoads DM, Siedow JN. 1995. Molecular interactions of *Bipolaris maydis* T-toxin and maize. *Can. J. Bot.* 73:S483–89
142. Liakopoulou-Kyriakides M, Lagopodi AL, Thanassouloupoulos CC, Stavropoulos GS, Magafa V. 1997. Isolation and synthesis of a host-selective toxin produced by *Alternaria alternata*. *Phytochemistry* 45:37–40
143. Liesch JM, Sweeley CC, Staffeld GD, Anderson MS, Weber DJ, et al. 1982. Structure of HC-toxin, a cyclic tetrapeptide from *Helminthosporium carbonum*. *Tetrahedron* 38:45–48

144. Lindgren PB. 1997. The role of *hrp* genes during plant-bacterial interactions. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 35:129–52
145. Litzenger CS. 1949. Nature of susceptibility to *Helminthosporium victoriae* and resistance to *Puccinia coronata* in Victoria oats. *Phytopathology* 39:300–19
146. Livingston RS, Scheffer RP. 1983. Conversion of *Helminthosporium sacchari* toxin to toxoids by  $\beta$ -galactofuranosidase from *Helminthosporium*. *Plant Physiol.* 72:530–34
147. Livingston RS, Scheffer RP. 1984. Selective toxins and analogs produced by *Helminthosporium sacchari*. Production, characterization, and biological activity. *Plant Physiol.* 76:96–102
148. Lu S, Lyngholm L, Yang G, Bronson C, Yoder OC, et al. 1994. Tagged mutations at the *Tox1* locus of *Cochliobolus heterostrophus* by restriction enzyme-mediated integration. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 91:12649–53
149. Luke HH, Murphy HC, Peter FC. 1966. Inheritance of spontaneous mutations of the Victoria locus in oats. *Phytopathology* 56:210–12
150. Luke HH, Wheeler HE. 1955. Toxin production by *Helminthosporium victoriae*. *Phytopathology* 45:453–58
151. Macko V. 1983. Structural aspects of toxins. In *Toxins and Plant Pathogenesis*, ed. JM Daly, BJ Deverall, pp. 41–80. Sydney:Academic
152. Macko V, Acklin W, Hildenbrand C, Weibel F, Arigoni D. 1983. Structure of three isomeric host-specific toxins from *Helminthosporium sacchari*. *Experientia* 39:343–47
153. Macko V, Goodfriend K, Wachs T, Renwick JAA, Acklin W, et al. 1981. Characterization of the host-specific toxins produced by *Helminthosporium sacchari*, the casual organism of eyespot disease of sugarcane. *Experientia* 37:923–24
154. Macko V, Stimmel MB, Wolpert TJ, Dunkle LD, Acklin W, et al. 1992. Structure of the host-specific toxins produced by the fungal pathogen *Periconia cirriata*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 89: 9574–78
155. Macko V, Wolpert TJ, Acklin W, Jaun B, Seibl J, et al. 1985. Characterization of victorin C, the major host-selective toxin from *Cochliobolus victoriae*: structure of degradation products. *Experientia* 41:1366–70
156. Markham JE, Hille J. 2001. Host-selective toxins as agents of cell death in plant-fungus interactions. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* 2:229–39
157. Martin GB. 1999. Functional analysis of plant disease resistance genes and their downstream effectors. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 2:273–79
158. Martinez JP, Ottum SA, Ali S, Francl LJ, Ciuffetti LM. 2001. Characterization of the *ToxB* gene from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 14:675–77
159. Martinou JC, Green DR. 2001. Breaking the mitochondrial barrier. *Nat. Rev.* 2: 63–67
160. Matthias R, Gierlich A, Hermann H, Hahn M, Schmidt B, et al. 1995. The race-specific elicitor, NIP1, from the barley pathogen, *Rhynchosporium secalis*, determines avirulence on host plants of the *Rrs1* resistance genotype. *EMBO J.* 14:4168–77
161. Masunaka A, Tanaka A, Tsuge T, Peever L, Timmer W, et al. 2000. Distribution and characterization of *AKT* homologs in the tangerine pathotype of *Alternaria alternata*. *Phytopathology* 90:762–68
162. Mayama S, Bordin APA, Morikawa T, Tanpo H, Kato H. 1995. Association of avenalumin accumulation with co-segregation of victorin sensitivity and crown rust resistance in oat lines carrying the *Pc-2* gene. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 46:263–74
163. Mayama S, Tani T, Ueno T, Midland SL, Simms JJ, et al. 1986. The purification of victorin and its phytoalexin elicitor

- activity in oat leaves. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 29:1–18
164. McDowell JM, Dangl JL. 2000. Signal transduction in the plant immune response. *Trends Biochem. Sci.* 25:79–82
  165. McNellis TW, Mudgett MB, Aoyama KLT, Horvath D, Chua NH, et al. 1998. Glucocorticoid-inducible expression of a bacterial avirulence gene in transgenic *Arabidopsis* induces hypersensitive cell death. *Plant J.* 14:247–57
  166. Meehan F, Murphy HC. 1946. A new *Helminthosporium* blight of oats. *Science* 104:413–14
  167. Meehan F, Murphy HC. 1947. Differential phytotoxicity of metabolic by-products of *Helminthosporium victoriae*. *Science* 106:270–71
  168. Meeley RB, Johal GS, Briggs SP, Walton JD. 1992. A biochemical phenotype for a disease resistance gene of maize. *Plant Cell* 4:71–77
  169. Meeley RB, Walton JD. 1991. Enzymatic detoxification of HC-toxin, the host-selective cyclic peptide from *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Plant Physiol.* 97:1080–86
  170. Merrill AH, Wang E, Gilchrist DG, Riley RT. 1993. Fumonisinis and other inhibitors of *de novo* sphingolipid biosynthesis. *Adv. Lipid Res.* 26:215–34
  - 170a. Mills D, Kunoh H, Keen NT, Mayama S, eds. 1996. *Molecular Aspects of Pathogenicity and Resistance: Requirement for Signal Transduction*. St. Paul, MN: APS Press
  171. Moore T, Martineau B, Bostock RM, Lincoln JE, Gilchrist DG. 1999. Molecular and genetic characterization of ethylene involvement in mycotoxin-induced plant cell death. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 54:73–85
  172. Multani DS, Meeley RB, Paterson AH, Gray J, Briggs SP, et al. 1998. Plant-pathogen microevolution: molecular basis for the origin of a fungal disease in maize. *Proc. Acad. Natl. Sci. USA* 95:1686–91
  173. Nakajima H, Scheffer RP. 1989. Metabolic transformation of HS-toxin in *Helminthosporium sacchari*. In *Host-Specific Toxins: Recognition and Specificity Factors in Plant Disease*, ed. K Kohmoto, RD Durbin, pp. 97–106. Totorri, Jpn.: Totorri Univ.
  174. Nakashima T, Ueno T, Fukami H, Taga T, Masuda H, et al. 1985. Isolation and structures of AK-toxin I and II, host-specific phytotoxic metabolites produced by *Alternaria alternata* Japanese pear pathotype. *Agric. Biol. Chem.* 49:807–15
  175. Navarre DA, Wolpert TJ. 1995. Inhibition of the glycine decarboxylase multienzyme complex by the host-selective toxin, victorin. *Plant Cell* 7:463–71
  176. Navarre DA, Wolpert TJ. 1999. Victorin induction of an apoptotic/senescence-like response in oats. *Plant Cell* 11:237–49
  177. Nelson OE, Ullstrup AJ. 1964. Resistance to leaf spot in maize. Genetic control of resistance to race 1 of *Helminthosporium carbonum* Ull. *J. Hered.* 55:195–99
  178. Nimchuk Z, Rohmer L, Chang JH, Dangl JL. 2001. Knowing the dancer from the dance: R-gene products and their interactions with other proteins from host and pathogen. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 4:288–94
  179. Nishimura S, Kohmoto K. 1983. Host-specific toxins and chemical structures from *Alternaria* species. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 21:87–116
  180. Okuno T, Ishita Y, Sawai K, Matsumoto T. 1974. Characterization of alternariolide, a host-specific toxin produced by *Alternaria mali* Roberts. *Chem. Lett.* 1974:635–38
  181. Otani H, Kodama M, Kohmoto K. 1996. Physiological and molecular aspects of *Alternaria* host-specific toxin and plant interactions. See Ref. 170a, pp. 257–67
  182. Otani H, Kohmoto K, Kodama M. 1995.

- Alternaria* toxins and their effects on host plants. *Can. J. Bot.* 73:S453–58
183. Otani H, Kohnobe A, Kodama M, Kohmoto K. 1998. Production of a host-specific toxin by germinating spores of *Alternaria brassicicola*. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 52:285–95
184. Panaccione DG, Scott -Craig JS, Pocard J-A, Walton JD. 1992. A cyclic peptide synthetase gene required for pathogenicity of the fungus *Cochliobolus carbonum* on maize. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 89: 6590–94
185. Park P. 1998. The accelerated effects of AK-toxin I on exocytosis and endocytosis of susceptible Japanese pear leaves. See Ref. 123a, pp. 125–35
186. Payne G, Knoche HW, Kono Y, Daly JM. 1980. Biological activity of purified host-specific pathotoxin produced by *Bipolaris (Helminthosporium) maydis*, race T. *Physiol. Plant Pathol.* 16:227–39
187. Pedras MSC, Zaharia IL, Gai Y, Zhou Y, Ward DE. 2001. In planta sequential hydroxylation and glycosylation of a fungal phytotoxin: avoiding cell death and overcoming the fungal invader. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 98:747–52
188. Pitkin JW, Panaccione DG, Walton JD. 1996. A putative cyclic peptide efflux pump encoded by the *TOXA* gene of the plant pathogenic fungus *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Microbiology* 142:1557–65
189. Pope MR, Ciuffetti LM, Knoche HW, McCrery D, Daly JM, et al. 1983. Structure of the host-specific toxin produced by *Helminthosporium carbonum*. *Biochemistry* 22:3502–6
190. Pringle RB, Scheffer RP. 1963. Purification of the selective toxin of *Periconia circinata*. *Phytopathology* 53:785–87
191. Ransom RF, Walton JD. 1997. Histone hyperacetylation in maize in response to treatment with HC-toxin or infection by the filamentous fungus *Cochliobolus carbonum*. *Plant Physiol.* 115:1021–27
192. Rhoads DM, Brunner-Neuenschwander B, Levings CS, Siedow JN. 1998. Characterization of the interaction between fungal pathotoxins and Urf13, the cms-T maize mitochondrial T-toxin receptor. See Ref. 123a, pp. 355–65
193. Richael C, Gilchrist D. 1999. The hypersensitive response: a case of hold or fold? *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 55:5–12
194. Rines HW, Luke HH. 1985. Selection and regeneration of toxin-insensitive plants from tissue cultures of oats (*Avena sativa*) susceptible to *Helminthosporium victoriae*. *Theor. Appl. Genet.* 71:16–21
195. Romanko RR. 1959. A physiological basis for resistance of oats to victoria blight. *Phytopathology* 49:32–36
196. Rose MS, Yoder OC, Turgeon BG. 1996. A decarboxylase required for polyketide toxin production and high virulence by *Cochliobolus heterostrophus*. (*Abstr.*) *Proc. Int. Symp. Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.*, 8<sup>th</sup>, Knoxville TN, pp. J-49
197. Ryerson DE, Heath MC. 1996. Cleavage of nuclear DNA into oligonucleosomal fragments during cell death induced by fungal infection or by abiotic treatments. *Plant Cell* 8:393–402
198. Sandermann H Jr. 2000. Active oxygen species as mediators of plant immunity: three case studies. *Biol. Chem.* 381:649–53
199. Scheffer RP, Livingston RS. 1984. Host-selective toxins and their role in plant diseases. *Science* 223:17–21
200. Scheffer RP, Nelson RR, Ullstrup AJ. 1967. Inheritance of toxin production and pathogenicity in *Cochliobolus carbonum* and *Cochliobolus victoriae*. *Phytopathology* 57:1288–91
201. Scheffer RP, Ullstrup AJ. 1965. A host-specific toxic metabolite from *Helminthosporium carbonum*. *Phytopathology* 55:1037–38
202. Schiffer R, Gorg R, Jarosch B, Beckhove U, Bahrenber G, et al. 1997. Tissue dependence and differential cordycepin sensitivity of race-specific

- resistance responses in the barley-powdery mildew interaction. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 10:830–39
203. Schottens-Toma IMJ, De Wit PJGM. 1988. Purification and primary structure of a necrosis-inducing peptide from the apoplastic fluids of tomato infected with *Cladosporium fulvum* (syn. *Fulvia fulva*). *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 33: 59–67
  204. Scott-Craig JS, Panaccione DG, Pocard J-A, Walton JD. 1992. The cyclic peptide synthetase catalyzing HC-toxin production in the filamentous fungus *Cochliobolus carbonum* is encoded by a 15.7-kb open reading frame. *J. Biol. Chem.* 267:26044–49
  205. Shain L, Wheeler H. 1975. Production of ethylene by oats resistant and susceptible to victorin. *Phytopathology* 65:88–89
  206. Singh P, Bugiani R, Cavanni P, Nakajima H, Kodama M, et al. 1999. Purification and biological characterization of host-specific SV-toxins from *Stemphylium vesicarium* causing brown spot of European pear. *Phytopathology* 89:947–53
  207. Singh RM, Wallace AT, Browning RM. 1968. Mitotic inhibition and histological changes induced by *Helminthosporium victoriae* toxin in susceptible oats (*Avena byzantina* C. Koch). *Crop Sci.* 8:143–46
  208. Staskawicz B, Mudgett MB, Dangl JL, Galan JE. 2001. Common and contrasting themes of plant and animal diseases. *Science* 292:2285–89
  209. Stierle AC, Cardellina JH, Strobel GA. 1988. Maculosin, a host-specific phyto-toxin for spotted knapweed from *Alternaria alternata*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 85:8008–11
  210. Stone JK. 2001. Necrotroph. In *Encyclopedia of Plant Pathology*, ed. OC Maloy, TD Murray, 2:676–77. New York: Wiley
  211. Stone JM, Heard JE, Asai T, Ausubel FM. 2000. Simulation of fungal-mediated cell death by fumonisin B1 and selection of fumonisin B1-resistant (fbr) *Arabidopsis* mutants. *Plant Cell* 12: 1811–22
  212. Strelkov SE, Lamari L, Ballance GM. 1999. Characterization of a host-specific protein toxin (Ptr ToxB) from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 12:728–32
  213. Tada Y, Hata S, Takata Y, Nakayashiki H, Tosa Y, et al. 2001. Induction and signaling of an apoptotic response typified by DNA laddering in the defense response of oats to infection and elicitors. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 14:477–86
  214. Takken FLW, Joosten MHAI. 2000. Plant resistance genes: their structure, function and evolution. *Eur. J. Plant Pathol.* 106:699–713
  215. Tamaki S, Dahlbeck D, Staskawicz B, Keen NT. 1988. Characterization and expression of two avirulence genes cloned from *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *glycinea*. *J. Bacteriol.* 170:4846–54
  216. Tanaka A, Shiotani H, Yamamoto M, Tsuge T. 1999. Insertional mutagenesis and cloning of the genes required for biosynthesis of the host-specific AK-toxin in the Japanese pear pathotype of *Alternaria alternata*. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 12:691–702
  217. Tanaka A, Tsuge T. 2000. Structural and functional complexity of the genomic region controlling AK-toxin biosynthesis and pathogenicity in the Japanese pear pathotype of *Alternaria alternata*. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 13:975–86
  218. Tanaka S. 1933. Studies on black spot disease of Japanese pears (*Pirus serotina* Rehd). *Mem. Coll. Agric. Kyoto Imp. Univ.* 28:1–31
  219. Thornberry NA, Lazebnik Y. 1998. Caspases: enemies within. *Science* 281: 1312–16
  220. Tiedemann AV. 1997. Evidence for a primary role of active oxygen species in induction of host cell death during infection of bean leaves with *Botrytis cinerea*. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 50:151–66
  221. Tobias CM, Oldroyd GED, Chang JH,



- Staskawicz BJ. 1999. Plants expressing the *Pto* disease resistance gene confer resistance to recombinant PVX containing the avirulence gene *AvrPto*. *Plant J.* 17: 41–50
222. Tomas A, Feng GH, Reech GR, Bockus WW, Leach JE. 1990. Purification of a cultivar-specific toxin of *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*, causal agent of tan spot of wheat. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 3:221–24
223. Tuori RP, Wolpert TJ, Ciuffetti LM. 1995. Purification and immunological characterization of toxic components from cultures of *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*. *Mol. Plant-Microbe Interact.* 8: 41–48
224. Tzeng T-H, Lyngholm LK, Ford CF, Bronson CR. 1992. A restriction fragment length polymorphism map of the fungal maize pathogen *Cochliobolus heterostrophus*. *Genetics* 130:81–96
225. Ueno T, Nakashima T, Uemota M, Fukami H, Lee SN, et al. 1977. Mass spectrometry of *Alternaria mali* toxins and related cyclodepsipeptides. *Biomed. Mass Spectrom.* 4:134–42
226. Ullrich CI, Novacky AJ. 1991. Electrical membrane properties of leaves, roots and single root cap cells of susceptible *Avena sativa*. *Plant Physiol.* 95:675–81
227. Ullstrup AJ. 1941. Inheritance of susceptibility to infection by *Helminthosporium maydis* race 1 in maize. *J. Agric. Res.* 63:331–34
228. Ullstrup AJ. 1941. Two physiologic races of *Helminthosporium maydis* in the corn belt. *Phytopathology* 31:508–21
229. Ullstrup AJ. 1944. Further studies on a species of *Helminthosporium* parasitizing corn. *Phytopathology* 34:214–22
230. Uren AG, Vaux DL. 1996. Molecular and clinical aspects of apoptosis. *Pharmacol. Ther.* 72:37–50
231. Walton JD. 1996. Host-selective toxins: agents of compatibility. *Plant Cell* 8: 1723–33
232. Walton JD, Earle ED. 1983. The epoxide in HC-toxin is required for activity against susceptible maize. *Physiol. Plant Pathol.* 22:371–76
233. Walton JD, Earle ED. 1985. Stimulation of extracellular polysaccharide synthesis in oat protoplasts by the host-specific phytotoxin victorin. *Planta* 165:407–15
234. Walton JD, Earle ED, Gibson BW. 1982. Purification and structure of the host-specific toxin from *Helminthosporium carbonum* race 1. *Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun.* 107:785–94
235. Walton JD, Panaccione DG. 1993. Host selective toxins and disease specificity: perspectives and progress. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 31:275–303
236. Wang H, Jones C, Ciacci-Zanella J, Holt T, Gilchrist DG, et al. 1996. Fumonisin and *Alternaria alternata lycopersici* toxins: sphinganine analog mycotoxins induce apoptosis in monkey kidney cells. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 93:3461–65
237. Wang H, Li J, Bostock RM, Gilchrist DG. 1996. Apoptosis: a functional paradigm for programmed plant cell death induced by a host-selective phytotoxin and invoked during development. *Plant Cell* 8:375–91
238. Ward DE, Gai Y, Ryszard L, Pedras MSC. 2001. Probing host-selective phytotoxicity: synthesis of destruxin B and several natural analogues. *J. Org. Chem.* 66:7832–40
239. Welsh JN, Peturson B, Machacek JE. 1954. Associated inheritance of reaction to races of crown rust, *Puccinia coronata avenae* Erikss., and to Victoria blight, *Helminthosporium victoriae* M. and M., in oats. *Can. J. Bot.* 32:55–68
240. Wevelsiep L, Kogel KH, Knogge W. 1991. Purification and characterization of peptides from *Rhynchosporium secalis* inducing necrosis in barley. *Physiol. Mol. Plant Pathol.* 39:471–82
241. Wevelsiep L, Ruppig E, Knogge W.

1993. Stimulation of barley plasma-lemma  $H^+$ -ATPase by phytotoxic peptides from the fungal pathogen *Rhynchosporium secalis*. *Plant Physiol.* 101: 297–301
242. Wheeler H, Black HS. 1962. Change in permeability induced by victorin. *Science* 137:983–84
243. White FF, Yang B, Johnson LB. 2000. Prospects for understanding avirulence gene function. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 3: 291–98
244. Wise RP, Fliss AE, Pring DR, Gengenbach BG. 1987. *urf13-T* of T cytoplasm maize mitochondria encodes a 13 kD polypeptide. *Plant Mol. Biol.* 9:121–26
245. Wolf SJ, Earle ED. 1991. Effects of *Helminthosporium carbonum* race 1 toxin on host and non-host cereal protoplasts. *Plant Sci.* 70:127–37
246. Wolpert TJ, Dunkle LD. 1980. Purification and partial characterization of host-specific toxins produced by *Periconia circinata*. *Phytopathology* 70:872–76
247. Wolpert TJ, Dunkle LD. 1983. Alterations in gene expression in sorghum induced by the host-specific toxin from *Periconia circinata*. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 80:6576–80
248. Wolpert TJ, Macko V. 1988. Molecular features affecting the biological activity of the host-selective toxins from *Cochliobolus victoriae*. *Plant Physiol.* 88:37–41
249. Wolpert TJ, Macko V, Acklin W, Jaun B, Arigoni D. 1986. Structure of minor host-selective toxins from *Cochliobolus victoriae*. *Experientia* 42:1296–99
250. Wolpert TJ, Macko V, Acklin W, Jaun B, Seibl J, et al. 1985. Structure of victorin C, the major host-selective toxin from *Cochliobolus victoriae*. *Experientia* 41:1524–29
251. Wolpert TJ, Navarre DA, Lorang JM, Moore DL. 1995. Molecular interactions of victorin and oats. *Can. J. Bot.* 73: S475–82
252. Wolpert TJ, Navarre DA, Lorang JM, Moore DL. 1996. Evaluation of the glycine decarboxylase complex as the possible site of action of victorin. See Ref. 170a, pp. 245–56
253. Wolpert TJ, Navarre DA, Moore DL, Macko V. 1994. Identification of the 100-kD victorin binding protein from oats. *Plant Cell* 6:1145–55
254. Wyllie AH. 1980. Glucocorticoid-induced thymocyte apoptosis is associated with endogenous endonuclease activation. *Nature* 284:555–56
255. Wyllie AH, Kerr JFR, Currie AR. 1980. Cell death: The significance of apoptosis. *Int. Rev. Cytol.* 68:251–306
256. Yang G, Rose MS, Turgeon BG, Yoder OC. 1996. A polyketide synthase is required for fungal virulence an production of the polyketide T-toxin. *Plant Cell* 8:2139–50
257. Yang Y, Shah J, Klessig DF. 1997. Signal perception and transduction in plant defense responses. *Genes Dev.* 11:1621–39
258. Yao N, Tada Y, Park P, Nakayashiki H, Tosa Y, et al. 2001. Novel evidence for apoptotic cell response and differential signals in chromatin condensation and DNA cleavage in victorin-treated oats. *Plant J.* 28:13–26
259. Yoder OC. 1973. A selective toxin produced by *Phyllosticta maydis*. *Phytopathology* 63:1361–65
260. Yoder OC. 1980. Toxins in pathogenesis. *Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.* 18:103–29
261. Yoder OC, Macko V, Wolpert TJ, Turgeon BG. 1997. *Cochliobolus* spp. and their host-specific toxins. In *The Mycota* Vol. 5: *Plant Relationships*, ed. G Carroll, P Tudzynski, pp. 145–66. Berlin: Springer Verlag
262. Yoder OC, Scheffer RP. 1969. Role of toxin in early interactions of *Helminthosporium victoriae* with susceptible and resistant oat tissue. *Phytopathology* 59: 1954–59
263. Yoder OC, Scheffer RP. 1973. Effects

- of *Helminthosporium carbonum* toxin on nitrate uptake and reduction by corn tissues. *Plant Physiol.* 52:513–17
264. Yoder OC, Scheffer RP. 1973. Effects of *Helminthosporium carbonum* toxin on absorption of solutes by corn roots. *Plant Physiol.* 52:518–23
265. Yu I-C, Parker J, Bent AF. 1998. Gene-for-gene disease resistance without the hypersensitive response in *Arabidopsis dnd1* mutant. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 95:7819–24
266. Zhang H-F, Francl LJ, Jordahl JG, Meinhardt SW. 1997. Structural and physical properties of a necrosis-inducing toxin from *Pyrenophora tritici-repentis*. *Phytopathology* 87:154–60
267. Zoratti M, Szabo I. 1995. The mitochondrial permeability transition. *Biochim. Biophys. Acta* 1241:139–76



## CONTENTS

---

FRONTISPIECE	xii
ONE FOOT IN THE FURROW: IMPLICATIONS TO ONE'S CAREER IN PLANT PATHOLOGY, <i>D. E. Mathre</i>	1
EVOLUTIONARY ECOLOGY OF PLANT DISEASES IN NATURAL ECOSYSTEMS, <i>Gregory S. Gilbert</i>	13
MAKING AN ALLY FROM AN ENEMY: PLANT VIROLOGY AND THE NEW AGRICULTURE, <i>Gregory P. Pogue, John A. Lindbo, Stephen J. Garger, and Wayne P. Fitzmaurice</i>	45
STRIPE RUST OF WHEAT AND BARLEY IN NORTH AMERICA: A RETROSPECTIVE HISTORICAL REVIEW, <i>Roland F. Line</i>	75
VIRAL SEQUENCES INTEGRATED INTO PLANT GENOMES, <i>Glyn Harper, Roger Hull, Ben Lockhart, and Neil Olszewski</i>	119
MOLECULAR BASIS OF RECOGNITION BETWEEN <i>PHYTOPHTHORA</i> PATHOGENS AND THEIR HOSTS, <i>Brett M. Tyler</i>	137
COMPARATIVE GENOMIC ANALYSIS OF PLANT-ASSOCIATED BACTERIA, <i>M. A. Van Sluys, C. B. Monteiro-Vitorello, L. E. A. Camargo, C. F. M. Menck, A. C. R. da Silva, J. A. Ferro, M. C. Oliveira, J. C. Setubal, J. P. Kitajima, and A. J. Simpson</i>	169
GENE EXPRESSION IN NEMATODE FEEDING SITES, <i>Godielieve Gheysen and Carmen Fenoll</i>	191
PHYTOCHEMICAL BASED STRATEGIES FOR NEMATODE CONTROL, <i>David J. Chitwood</i>	221
HOST-SELECTIVE TOXINS AND AVIRULENCE DETERMINANTS: WHAT'S IN A NAME? <i>Thomas J. Wolpert, Larry D. Dunkle, and Lynda M. Ciuffetti</i>	251
TOBACCO MOSAIC VIRUS ASSEMBLY AND DISASSEMBLY: DETERMINANTS IN PATHOGENICITY AND RESISTANCE, <i>James N. Culver</i>	287
MICROBIAL POPULATIONS RESPONSIBLE FOR SPECIFIC SOIL SUPPRESSIVENESS TO PLANT PATHOGENS, <i>David M. Weller, Jos M. Raaijmakers, Brian B. McSpadden Gardener, and Linda S. Thomashow</i>	309

PATHOGEN POPULATION GENETICS, EVOLUTIONARY POTENTIAL, AND DURABLE RESISTANCE, <i>Bruce A. McDonald and Celeste Linde</i>	349
USE OF MULTILINE CULTIVARS AND CULTIVAR MIXTURES FOR DISEASE MANAGEMENT, <i>C. C. Mundt</i>	381
BIOLOGICAL CONTROL OF POSTHARVEST DISEASES OF FRUITS, <i>Wojciech J. Janisiewicz and Lise Korsten</i>	411
ANTIBIOTIC USE IN PLANT AGRICULTURE, <i>Patricia S. McManus,</i> <i>Virginia O. Stockwell, George W. Sundin, and Alan L. Jones</i>	443
RISK ASSESSMENT OF VIRUS-RESISTANT TRANSGENIC PLANTS, <i>Mark Tepfer</i>	467
INDEXES	
Subject Index	493
Cumulative Index of Contributing Authors, Volumes 31–40	521
Cumulative Index of Chapter Titles, Volumes 31–40	525
ERRATA	
An online log of corrections to <i>Annual Review of Phytopathology</i> chapters (if any, 1997 to the present) may be found at <a href="http://phyto.annualreviews.org/">http://phyto.annualreviews.org/</a>	